DCN: 11572

The Honorable Sue Turner
Commissioner

DEFENSE BASE CLOSURE AND REALIGNMENT COMMISSION

BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS REGIONAL HEARING

JULY 6, 2005

Rhode Island, Connecticut, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, Maine

DCN: 11572

Turner

6 Jul 05

RHODE ISLAND

Sen Reed - Keep in RI Naval Warfare Dev Cmd and

Gov Carcieri - recent DOD plus ups

Sen Chafee

Congr Kennedy - re NWDC & undersea sensors system loss - why?

Congr Langevin (HASC) -

Keith Stokes - Newport CC - undersea warfare systems + NWDC + PME. - RI Guard - Quonset Point - C130 - close port to Europe.

close Sen Reed | RI $120M bonds for infrastructure

Subsurface Maritime Communications Capability - why? Cost?

NWDC - ↓ doctrine + planning loss of synergy ↑↓ sea.

Anti Submarine Warfare Games 7th Fleet CONOPS -

Keeping it leverage jointness, strategic + intellectual capabilities

Land, Bldg, Infrastructure - RI has provided land, $, etc.

Costs: restructured electricity rates + solid waste fees = >1.7M savings

"RI Salutes" - merchant discounts

KS - ↑ to 200 acres could be available

DCN: 11572

6 Jul CONNECTICUT (p1)

> Gov Rell (Jodi) -

Groton sub base = rec underwrites

Left out clean up costs. All sub stuff here

> Sen Dodd -

> Largest home port berthing capacity - adj to Electric Boat

Argues Rec "alters size of force structure"

Closures leaves no choice but downsize sub force.

Cannot be replicated

> 103rd loss - no fly mission for ANG

> Video - Duncan Hunter (HASC Chm) speaks to keeping it.

> Adm. Konetzni - Sub Cmdr - Fleet. "here" for national security.

USN only does anti-sub warfare

* Makes a lot of sense

400 subs out there - 1/2 belong to friends. China ↑↑ # subs

Threat real - China / No Korea

Today - 80% at sea - no time to do maintenance

NL to China shorter than west Coast - shorter to Gulf

Training allies - need ↑ (So Korea)

Series of Studies - agree >55 subs = risk/danger

Believes budget-driven decisions about national security.

☆ Subs are instruments of national security.

Rec endorses Ctr of Excellence - deviates from MV criteria

> John Casey - Electric Boat. 15 of 19 designed sub class - delivered >200

Virginia Class - crew integral to test - train on actual equip -

Jimmy Carter SSN 23 - took 5yr - crew assigned 2yr prior to finish

unique synergy

EB found ways to keep rate at $50/yr

Overhaul + Repair val They do helps ↓ cost.

3 of 5 Groton-ers work there.

Manages floating dry dock for USN - surge capability

DCN: 11572

6 Jul MASS

Sen Kennedy — planes support DC, NY, + DC (50, 37, 3) — otis key to HS

USCG at otis as well as ANG — CG wasn't consulted + has $20M to remain

~~Gov~~ Mitt Romney

- Mass Tech clusters — likes ESC moves to Hanscom
- AF did not consult — no cost savings only shifted. Mil reserve closing air field impacts CG, Army Guard re rescues. Moving fighters next door makes no sense.

* Wants Gov/ANG to submit alternate proposal

Home to: early warning system

Rep. Delahunt-10

No savings - just shifting

USCG - big hit. Lots of unasweered Qs re protection, security, enforcement, fire, rescue, ???

TAG BG Oliver Mason - USAG

Col. Paul Worcester - Cmdr Otis

1. Mil Val Calc
   - incorrect data → low score 42.83 Recalculated → 60.88 #27
   - Current/Future Mission: improper credit + missed 3 ranges - >30 F-15 6C-17s 46K tons
   - Capacity + Surge — infrastructure large re hanger, ramp, munitions

   Otis — unsaturated on, primary range user (9 separate units)

* - AF ignored Homeland Defense —

2. Cost Savings — didn't rank high enough in Mil Val to be entered into cost

   Actual "savings" aren't! Recurring costs not included, Tenants left behind — who pays?? Adj - break even > 2024

3. Homeland Defense — 16000 Int flights/mo - 422 flights of interest/mo

   Otis alert gets there 19 min faster than new site

   USCG — helicopter response BIG Issue - 100 nautical miles

* Wrong score — COBRA bad — Brac law + homeland defense ignored

DCN: 11572

Sen Gregg
Sen Sununu

6 Jul NEW HAMPSHIRE

Portsmouth Naval Shipyard

Intro - Sen Gregg

1 Sen Snowe - 4 subs not accounted for in Force Str Plan
1) Ops Readiness - USN did not acct for loss of PNS work. No real ex. cogac. Special skills lost. Combatant Cmdr want PNS to do their work
2) Facilities - 3 drydocks at PNS would have to be built elsewhere at $400M each.
3) Surge - contract out shortages.
4) Costs - 700M not accounted for; closing Pearl a better choice.
5) Savings - 2042
6) Economic - wrong statuscalarea - used Maine not NH.
8) Environ - excluded restoration

Adm Konetzni -
- Navy issues - mine warfare + submarine warfare
- Pacific area - No Korea & China buying subs + missiles -
> SSN Force Level Shortfall - 55 ideal - by 2030, <30 - PRC + NK continue to ↑
Must sustain ability to gain access overseas.

from K Lemm
Depot Maintenance - Sub life = 33 yr 11% life in depot/drydock
Unplanned Events - some repairs lengthy.
Keep shipyard open

Mr Donnell - representing PNS people
East Coast SRAs (short term oil change) - TBD -
Pearl - transit time issue, planned durations notional, usually over cost.
USN erred; data doesn't support closure.

DCN: 11572

6 Jul MAINE 3:30 – 5:30

Intro Sen Snowe Brunswick NAS.

MMA – Multimission Maritime Aircraft (B737s)

wrong ROI/MSA – so impact 8x worse.

RAdm Harry Rich – Mil Value

Proximity to shipping lanes – 1/2 cost NASB vs J-Ville

Dual runways. Rec put all P3s at J-Ville

P-3s being overused now – MMAs due 2012 or so.

Sen Collins – Mil Val

Prior BRAC closed all AD bases in NE.

J-V 1000 mi circle doesn't hit shipping lanes until they hit near coast.

Navy ignored own stats to keep NASB open. Hangar 6 = MMA support.

Site in excellent shape – recent upgrades + NATO support –

- simulators
- unencumbered air space
- 1st stop from Mid East ops
- Temp Billets
- Big ramp
- could expand

Sen Snowe – Cost + Savings

Cost analysis based on P3s which phase out in 2012!

Personnel cost savings less.

Routes for P3 deployments pass NASB (1200 to J-V)

J-V construction can't start until current ops move out.

Financial justification fails. 9 yr Payback – only saves $56M.

10.4% or 8x higher

Cong Tom Allen – Economic Impact. VERY wrong labor mkt used

Close Sen Snowe

Decision is "litany of failures".

DCN: 11572

6 Jul CONNECTICUT (p2)

> George Sawyer – Culture of Sub Force (Former Asst Sec Navy)
Multidimensional Partnership → Culture
↓ repair val at EB will ↑ EB new constr costs.
> New SSN Constr Cost = SSN Life Cycle Support Interdependent.

> Sen Reed – RI
NL & Newport proximity → collab → Innovation.
> John Markowicz re mil Val ~~+ Cost/Savings~~ Cham, ~~Release~~ Redesign Comm
MV – 18 SSNs + sub school – only certified + home port in US
why?? ★ NUMI trains med techs for sub duty – moved to FSH + Pensacola
failure – jointness, strategic value, op readiness
– no points for nuclear certified waterfront (only given to Kings Bay Nuclr ship)
– USN ignored relevant, cert info → NL undervalued re unique/specialized trng
Scored as zero when Q's dropped
– Overvalued irrelevant info – re, distance to ranges subs don't need or use
– Ops trng Qs – not applicable so got low scores.
Geez > – Inaccurate scoring – Sub School considered/scored as "tenant"
– Q re length/cond pers – ? credit – redacted info.
– NL can accommodate – KB must "nest"
Interesting twist } Earlier – move of subs (Scenario 004) from Norfolk to NL
dropped due to inaccurate reporting of dock under repair
→ failed to distinguish surface base from subsurface base
– 10/14 ĉ lower MV/remain open.
★ Adj value = KB

DCN: 11572

6 July CONN (3)

Markowitz — cont

Criterion 2 — Land, Facilities

- 10 piers = 20 SSNs KB builds
- NL - sub school walking distance KB build away
- NL - no nesting as at norfolk + KB
- KB - no SSN maintenance facilities
- NL - 1 floating dry dock.
- KB - new piers req

Key — Berthing — inboard + outboard - requires repositioning to do work

Norfolk - needs dredging KB - ?

Trident missile arc at KB — can't park in it.

Criterion 3

Dec 04 → Mar 05 — ↓ 21% drop in SSN — no documents re Δ proposed scenario 003 to NL

☆ ↓ Atlantic SSN surge capacity.

Pre-BRAC — 1 SBMN sub homeport E + W coast + 2 ports each nuke carrier berth

others (Everett + San Diego) exempted (less capability)

→ GabeStern - Analyst Criteria 4+5

Annual recurring savings - most sensitive COBRA area.

Excess savings from billets at KB + Norfolk could be achieved ↓ close NL

To move sub school — add $105M

Undercost on billets savings. Break even - may be 2057!

COBRA uses artificially low discount rate.

Mr Abromatis - Economic Impact.

CN = 68% of jobs lost re BRAC $3.3B impact

Mr Blodgett — long term impact - Jul 95 study picked NL over KB/Norfolk for seawolf homeport.

Comm McCarthy - excl restoration costs - closure $31.1 M short - Remed $101M annual cost dredging at KB

NL - no storms, no endangered species

DCN: 11572

6 Jul

CONN (4)

Rod Simmons (Rep)

Prematurely ends debate on SSN force level.

No strategic rationale

No decision pending QDR

Survived '95 BRAC

BG Thaddeus Martin – TAG-CT (Bradley ANG Base)

Calculations confusing — not given full credit.

C-17s – can hold 20 vs 3 credited

Corrected – new MV 41.

Park 36 ~~A-10s~~ planes

Rec – 5 ANG c̄ 18 PAA each.

Need to support 10 AEF – only 9 under current Recs

★ Removing Bradley fixes AEF req.

Problems: can't move members across state lines

5 approval of Gov + TAG.

Transition F-15 pilots to A-10s.

Sen Leiberman

~~Understated Mil Val~~

Overstates cost savings

Moving costs overstated

Closure is irrevocable.

DCN: 11572

6 Jul

MASS (2)

Sen Kerry

HD – Costs – Tenants' mission (esp USCG)

Barnes ANG – A10's, munitions, any transport

Hanscom – unique hi tech – losing 2 parts

Congr. Stephen Lynch – Boston Planning Yard

Puget Sound Advisory Det

Measured as a "shipyard" or "Repair facility"!!

Only link to Puget Sound is they manage payroll.

Cost savings way off!

Doesn't matter where it is, so stay here. They PLAN

DCN: 11572

6 Jul

New Hampshire – (2)

Human Capital – trng → apprentice → journeyman → nuke/rad trng takes about 10 yr. Train where they'll work – don't move.

Dredge would be a challenge.

Paint / blasting skill – low #s

Navy underestimates workload + reg future capacity.

PNS – seems to outperform NNSY, PHNSY, + PSNY

Project PNSY will be profitable if left open.

Paul

MR O'Connor – Union re culture

Rep Tom Allen –

Sen Susan Collins – ME

COBRA showed PNSY ~~saved~~ remaining open saves money.

No measure for "efficiency/effectiveness".

Sen John Ensunu

298 M costs to close not factored in

1.5 B overstating savings. Payback – off 30 yr

Rep. Jim Bradley

Cost of Reconstitution – est deep H2O nuke port take a LONG time.

400M – new drydock today – politics of nukes

Gov Baldacci ME – re cleanup – approx $100M vs $46M

Gov John Lynch NH – wrong ROI (workers live in York (ME) + NH near base)

Sen Judd Gregg – if closed, 1.2 B cost, not 285M – yr ~~2012~~ 2025.

DCN: 11572

Loring Commerce Ctr

6 Jul MAINE - DFAS/Limestone

Sen Snowe

MV=0 solely D/T not on active base - NO SITE VISIT

Closed Loring AFB - transition to DFAS Limestone is heart of area's economic recovery -

1. Secure no credit for extra 15 acres
2. Trained E's - excellent record - awards
3. Flawed data assumptions
4. no savings - 7.8m cost Should expand not close
5. severe economic impact - best jobs in area - no problem hiring
6. low cost Ctr of Excellence - expandable

Got 548 Should be 849 or 2nd highest

AT/FP required being on military installation - apparently old AFB doesn't count.
Security - no cameras
Local workforce pool - small town #s not helpful but jobs filled
Facility Condition - < 100K repairs

Gov Baldacci re Econ. Impact
South - 4% unemploy / BAD /

Sen Collins - Cost/Savings

never looked a keeping it open, only ran COBRA Close scenarios.
Actually ↑ workforce → ↓ costs. Closure does nothing but cost to close
A In determining "3" sites, economic impact not included
It was calculated & was the highest, but not factored in!

own power grid

Congr Mike Michaud - Ctr of Excellence Working Capital Fund
Cost $4.88/ft² - 50yr no cost lease - can expand - access to 15 acres
Highest employee sat ratings than 3 in Rec

2 of 3 Rec on same grid

Carl Flora - Pres/Loring Dev Authority DFAS Cmte Rep