

REGIONAL HEARING ISSUE SUMMARY
Buffalo Regional Hearing
June 27, 2005

State of New York

Niagara Falls Air Reserve Center

- Witness: Governor George Pataki
 - Niagara Falls Air Reserve Center is Western New York's only remaining federal institution. Also, it is the headquarters of the areas joint military task force responsible for any homeland defense or response missions.
 - Was not consulted (along with the TAG) concerning the proposal.

- Witness: Senator Charles Schumer
 - Multiple training missions can occur on a touch and go basis resulting in multiple missions per day, whereas Little Rock can only complete one mission per day.
 - Not encumbered by infrastructure, weather and space restraints and encroachment is not an issue.

- Witness: Senator Hillary Rodham Clinton
 - The recommendation circumvents the legislative process because the proper balance of airlift between active duty and reserve components needs to be addressed by Congress.

- Witness: Richard Dewitt (Niagara Military Affairs Council)
 - Adjusted COBRA data reveals that the AF NPV savings of \$199M actually becomes \$8.9M in costs because the end strength is not reduced and therefore the elimination of part time personnel should not be counted for.
 - Regular training sessions with the Army's 107 makes the base a joint installation. Also, the Niagara Frontier Transportation will extend their current joint use agreement for \$1 a year.
 - Recruitment and Retention is 99%. This is 25% higher than active duty Air Force.
 - Focus analysis on bases comparable to Niagara's operational and cost effectiveness. Also, examine installations not on the list that have encroachment issues and in areas where excess tanker and airlift capacity exists because the AF retained single flying wing bases with similar MCI scores.
 - The recommendation would affect 3.5% of the county's jobs, 2% of its gross county product and 8.5% of its payroll.

REGIONAL HEARING ISSUE SUMMARY

Buffalo Regional Hearing

June 27, 2005

- Witness: Representative Louise Slaughter
 - Ascertains that subjective analysis resulting from flawed evidence leads the state to believe this is a “Plane Grab”.
 - Consolidating all resources in one place may have latent adverse effects (Pearl Harbor).

- Witness: Representative Tom Reynolds
 - Closing the installation will generate no savings, correct no imbalances to the C-130 Fleet and contribute nothing to force transformation.

- Witness: Representative Brian Higgins
 - No new issues.

Air Force Research Laboratory Rome

- Witness: Governor Pataki
 - The MILVAL of the facility suggests retention. Also, the high cost of realignment runs counter to BRAC objective.

- Witness: Senator Charles Schumer
 - Rome is the information directorate headquarters and therefore to stay consistent with consolidating geographically separate headquarters components all info directorates should be relocated to Rome.

- Witness: Senator Hillary Rodham Clinton
 - The lab was established in Rome because of it’s a topographically ideal place to test sensor technology. Is there evidence whether DoD considered the topography at Wright Patterson that would allow the same experimentation or testing?

- Witness: Senator Maier
 - The recommendation does not take into consideration the relationship between sensors and information technology.
 - Does Wright Patterson have the licenses and frequency available to test sensors?
 - Relocating to Wright Patterson requires relocating radar antenna and building specialized labs.

REGIONAL HEARING ISSUE SUMMARY

Buffalo Regional Hearing

June 27, 2005

- Witness: Representative Sherwood Boehlert
 - The recommendation does not consider the full cost of relocation. Also, the Rome facility should be further developed to take advantage of its unique topography and environment.
- Witness: Representative John McHugh
 - Effective research is not devoid of the surrounding commercial and intellectual environment.

DFAS Rome

- Witness: Senator Charles Schumer
 - Streamlining DFAS would undermine the ability to cope with wartime needs. For example the distribution of benefits to the guard and reserve.
 - If consolidation needs to take place it should happen at Rome.
- Witness: Senator Hillary Rodham Clinton
 - DFAS Rome plays a crucial war in supporting OIF/GWOT and the learned expertise should not be disrupted.
 - Expanding the facility would maximize the quality of service at the lowest cost available.
- Witness: Senator Maier
 - MILVAL and Mission effectiveness was accomplished through the partnership model promised to the last BRAC Commission.
 - 26 centers may be too many but 3 megacenters may be a security risk.
- Witness: Representative Sherwood Boehlert
 - The recommendation failed to account for the affordability of leveraging existing low cost centers (The operating cost per square foot in Rome is ½ of Columbus and Denver and 1/3 that in Indianapolis).
 - DFAS is already connected to satellite and international offices. Maintaining multiple DFAS centers around the country on different power grids safeguards against security threats.
 - DFAS Rome should be expanded in the interest of the economy and efficiency.

Watervliet Arsenal

REGIONAL HEARING ISSUE SUMMARY
Buffalo Regional Hearing
June 27, 2005

- Witnesses: Governor George Pataki, Senator Schumer and Senator Clinton
 - Support the recommendation.

- Witnesses: Harry Robinson and Tony Gaetano
 - Ready to execute the plan by using statewide resources.

REGIONAL HEARING ISSUE SUMMARY

Buffalo Regional Hearing

June 27, 2005

The State of Ohio

Wright Patterson Air Force Base, OH

- Witness: Rep. David Hobson (OH-7)
 - Analysis does not include 715 direct, on-site contractor employees required to sustain the operation at either DFSG & OSSG. Also assumes 2400 positions will be reduced but no supporting documentation.
 - Collocating Air Force Material Command (AFMC) at W-P would be easier, less expensive and the “functional owners of the business processes that the information systems support” are located.

- Witness: Congressman Turner
 - Missions gained through proposed recommendations “enhance bases capabilities and creates additional centers of excellence”.
 - Reject recommendation that relocates the Air & Space Information Systems Research and Developments Acquisition to Hanscom in Massachusetts because it is based on \$410M promised in state funding if the DoD brings new technical missions to the installation (they will increase capacity and infrastructure).
 - Hanscom must be expanded to accept nearly 1400 jobs (1200 Jobs from Maxwell AFB, AL) but DoD’s recommendation recognizes that unconstrained land is not available. Massachusetts suggests the installation needs state subsidized-aid to support additional functions.

- Witness: General Lester Lyles
 - Single largest employer in Dayton, Ohio.
 - DFSG supports critical wartime initiatives that are performed by off-base contractors located in the Dayton area.
 - DFSG mission is associated with business-related technology while the C4SRI mission relates to embedded information technology.
 - DFSG draws from the IT community based in Dayton whose work relates to business management systems. Argues the IT companies in Dayton as well as the contractors who support wartime initiatives were not included when determining MILVAL.
 - Scenario requires approximately 40 acres of land Hanscom has approx. 19 acres of available land; but only 8 acres of unconstrained land is zoned for industrial operations (criteria #2)
 - DoD’s data significantly understates cost (criteria #4). Justification is provided showing costs as high as \$200M not accounted for.

REGIONAL HEARING ISSUE SUMMARY
Buffalo Regional Hearing
June 27, 2005

DFAS Cleveland, OH

- Witness: Fred Nance, chairman of the Cleveland Defense Industry Alliance
 - Inaccurate calculation of MILVAL criteria for all DFAS operations (this does not affect Cleveland's ranking).
 - MILVAL should focus on people/services provided vs. facility assessment (90% the former and 10% the latter)
 - DFAS services do not need to be located on DoD installations and the JC-S group exemplified this in their recommendation to move 3,500 employees to Indianapolis (which is not on DoD installation). Also, the recommendation ignores the 435 non-DoD civilians that remain in the building.
 - Inconsistent method of analysis (binary vs. linear) was performed. For example, Cleveland's facility has 19 unique corporate process application but they received the same score as Denver even though they only have 5.
 - The facility should not be penalized for high lease cost because the Federal Government charges \$29.12 per sq. /ft. even though the market average is \$14.70.

- Witness: Representative Steven LaTourette (OH-14)
 - Review entire DFAS Analysis.

- Witness: Jane L. Campbell, Mayor of Cleveland
 - Operations can be consolidated in Cleveland because they have plans for a new site which can meet security considerations, have advanced telecommunications capabilities and that can be expanded.

- Witness: Rep. Stephanie Tubbs-Jones (OH-11)
 - Cleveland has the highest poverty rate in the country (31.1%)
 - NASA is laying off 1000 workers
 - Was the disruption of services considered?
 - 90% of the facilities workers have been there on average over 5 years. Where will you find qualified employees?
 - \$52M to house in receiving communities

REGIONAL HEARING ISSUE SUMMARY

Buffalo Regional Hearing

June 27, 2005

Defense Supply Center Columbus, OH

- Witness: Senator Mike Dewine
 - The installation can support the proposed recommendation as well as more missions in the future.

DFAS Dayton, OH

- Witness: Marilou Smith, Mayor, City of Kettering
 - Economic impact of closing Gentile AF Station in 93 was 1 billion dollars.
 - Reject proposal to close facility
- Witness: Rep. Michael Turner
 - Deviation from criteria 4 because costs exceed savings
 - AFMC (which oversees 11 of the bases serviced by DFAS-Dayton) is headquartered at W-P. AFMC also controls 60% of the AF budget.
 - Rent free 50 year lease provided by the city

Mansfield Lahm Air Guard Station & Springfield-Beckley Air Guard, OH

- Witness: Michael G. Oxley (OH-4)
 - AF template same for all components while other services developed separate templates
 - No Adjutant General input in the development of the AF criteria but the Army National Guard's TAG was involved.
 - MILVAL pertaining to personnel was miscalculated.
 - Capacity analysis was inaccurate 12 PAA BBEDDDOWN cost is \$13.7M while the cost at Maxwell (just to gain 4 aircrafts) is \$15.9M. COBRA analysis indicates the total cost for shifting to receiving facilities is \$21.6M. Therefore, there is a negative return on investment (\$-7.9M).
- Witness: Rep. David Hobson (OH-7)
 - Only had one day to review the COBRA data before members of staff visited.
 - The unit is an F-16 Formal Training Units (AF stated there was only one).
 - The timeline for the recommendation is nonsensical because the pilots are kept until 2010 but maintenance and personnel are removed in 2007 and the students are removed in 2008. \$80M secured for the mission to be kept until 2015.

REGIONAL HEARING ISSUE SUMMARY

Buffalo Regional Hearing

June 27, 2005

- AF projections indicate F-16 aircrafts will not be flying past 2015 (at the latest) yet NPV shows it will take more than 18 years to realize a turn on the initial investment. Expected savings past 2015 are not real.
 - The unique structure and mission capabilities, homeland defense missions and the cost of training new recruits were not taken into account.
-
- Witness: Major General Greg Wyatt, Adjutant General
 - Tags were never consulted by the AF during the BRAC process.
 - "Material Deviations" from Law
 - PAA realignment and MILVAL evaluation resulted in proposals to close 5 and realign 28 ANG bases
 - AF used the MCI tool to rank bases and establish MILVAL but there are critical differences between various components in the services.
 - ANG is the most efficient component, providing 47% of the Total Air Composition at approximately 8% of the Total Annual AF Budget, why did AF use efficiency as justification?

Comments

- Witness: Governor Bob Taft
 - DoD deviated from BRAC criteria because the recommendation did not consider the "exceptional staffing levels" at the states ANG facilities. Bases are slated to grow even though their recruiting and retention rates are below 100%.
 - Homeland Security mission was not taken into consideration.
 - Capacity information on Springfield's ramps and operations is inaccurate because data was collected on Springfield but then evaluated the 178th as an operational unit.
 - DFAS Cleveland should not be reprimanded for the above market rental charges GSA imposes.
 - The army vehicle technology directorate should not be moved from the NASA Glenn Research Center because of the cost to duplicate the facility as well the loss of expertise.
 - Endorses all recommendations concerning mission realignments to Wright Patterson AFB. Although the computer based business management systems (incorrectly categorized as C4ISR) should remain at W-P because of the proximity to the business process owners.
 - Investigate the recommendations concerning the realignment of the Joint Systems Manufacturing Center at Lima (a.k.a. Lima Tank Plant) because capacity is at almost 100%