

DCN: 8218

**Reborchick, Margaret, CIV, WSO-BRAC**

---

**From:** Flinn, Michael, CIV, WSO-BRAC  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 23, 2005 7:02 PM  
**To:** Reborchick, Margaret, CIV, WSO-BRAC  
**Subject:** FW: Coalition Rebuttal To Air Force C-130 Response  
**Attachments:** 1191566620-AFRC CPFH.xls; 412734585-COBRA Model Excursions 5.doc; 318563582-Cost Analysis.doc; 2888790417-Bragg JAATTs.xls; 4122750872-Point Paper JAATT.doc; 4015180317-DCN 5895.pdf; 183563198-Coalition Rebuttal-.doc

Marcy,

I may have already sent this to you.

---

**From:** BRAC Task Force [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 11, 2005 10:16 AM  
**To:** Mike Flinn  
**Subject:** Coalition Rebuttal To Air Force C-130 Response

Dear Dr. Flinn:

I have attached a document with exhibits that we have prepared in response to the Air Force's latest position on the C-130 installations realignment. This package is being presented jointly by Pittsburgh, PA, Niagara Falls, NY, Milwaukee, WI, and Charleston, WV. Please ensure that this is distributed to the necessary individuals on the BRAC Commission.

*Chip Holsworth*

Charles L. "Chip" Holsworth  
BRAC War Room  
1550 Coraopolis Heights Road  
Coraopolis, PA 15108  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]

---

[Start your day with Yahoo! - make it your home page](#)

8/24/2005

## JA/ATT Missions Scheduled Jun 02 - Jun 05

Location	MAJCOM	Unit	JA/ATT Missions Scheduled	Missions for 18th Abn Corps	Aircraft for 18th Abn Corps	Missions for 82nd Abn Div	Aircraft for 82nd Abn Division	Missions Supporting Both	Total Aircraft	Avg A/C per month to
Pope	AMC	43 AW	368	97	203	105	145	202	348	9.4
Pittsburgh	AFRC	911 AW	178	24	66	5	8	29	74	2.0
Dyess <sup>3</sup>	AMC	317 AG	282	7	7	33	38	40	45	1.2
Charlotte	ANG	145 AW	98	2	2	21	22	23	24	0.6
Yeager	ANG	130 AW	40	6	19	3	5	9	24	0.6
Milwaukee	AFRC	440 AW	120	9	13	1	1	10	14	0.4
Little Rock	AMC	314 AW	19	2	8	3	6	5	14	0.4
Niagara	AFRC	914 AW	126	9	9	2	3	11	12	0.3
Quonset <sup>4</sup>	ANG	143 AW	28	10	12	0	0	10	12	0.3
Youngstown	AFRC	910 AW	154	4	7	2	4	6	11	0.3
Willow Grove	AFRC	913 AW	170	5	2	13	8	18	10	0.3
Keesler <sup>4</sup>	AFRC	403 AW	58	8	7	3	3	11	10	0.3
Dobbins	AFRC	94 AW	108	4	3	2	6	6	9	0.2
Martinsburg	ANG	167 AW	104	0	0	7	9	7	9	0.2
Nashville	ANG	118 AW	43	4	8	0	0	4	8	0.2
Louisville	ANG	123 AW	77	3	3	5	2	8	5	0.1
Mansfield	ANG	179 AW	40	4	4	1	1	5	5	0.1
Selfridge	ANG	171 AS	51	0	0	2	3	2	3	0.1
Maxwell	AFRC	908 AW	133	1	2	0	0	1	2	0.1
Peoria	ANG	182 AW	62	1	1	1	1	2	2	0.1
New Castle	ANG	166 AW	26	0	0	2	2	2	2	0.1
Savannah	ANG	165 AW	65	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0
Martin State <sup>4</sup>	ANG	135 AS	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0

*Click in Header Cells with red text to sort by that column.*

<sup>1</sup> Statistics extracted from JA/ATT Annex C. Period covered from Jun 2002 through Jun 2005 (37 Months). Scheduled missions does not take into account cancellations due to weather, maintenance, etc. Assumed level playing field for all due to OIF and OEF commitments.

<sup>2</sup> Extracted numbers only include JA/ATT missions providing support to 18th Airborne Corps and 82 Airborne Division at Fort Bragg.

<sup>3</sup> Aircraft numbers are those assigned to the mission. It does not take into account a single aircraft assigned to a multi-day mission

<sup>4</sup> Conversion to C-130J and associated airdrop restrictions may have affected JA/ATT participation.

Cost Analysis of Pope AFB closing versus additional costs incurred by supporting Fort Bragg training from ARC within 2 hour flying radius

1. Average aircraft per month supplied by 43 AW supporting 18 <sup>th</sup> Airborne Corps and 82 <sup>nd</sup> Airborne Division <sup>1</sup>	9.4
2. Total aircraft supplied for one year	
3. Additional round trip flying hours to support missions from ARC C-130 bases	113
	4.0
4. Total additional flying hours per year <sup>2</sup>	
5. Average AFRC Cost Per Flying Hour (CFPH) <sup>3</sup>	452
6. Total yearly cost	\$1857
	\$839,364

1 See attached spreadsheet with JA/ATT Annex C extracted data.

2 These hours are already allocated into the ARC's budget. "Additional" refers to hours flown that would not be flown by aircraft stationed at Pope AFB.

3 See attached spreadsheet with AFRC/LGQP CPFH figures.

**COBRA Model Excursions 5 (Jul 21, 1320 Eastern)  
Pittsburgh BRAC Task Force**

At the request of the task force, a series of excursions using the COBRA data supporting the Department of Defense (DoD) recommendations that impact Pittsburgh International Airport (IAP) and area units were completed.

**1. Excursion Name: Pittsburgh Actions Only.**

- a. Overview: The purpose of the excursion was to determine the costs and savings associated only with actions directly attributable to the 911<sup>th</sup> Airlift Wing's (AW) closure and distribution of its aircraft and personnel.
- b. Baseline COBRA File: USAF 0122V3 (316.3).
- c. Modification to AF COBRA assumptions: Deleted all actions, costs and savings other than those directly associated with the closure of the 911<sup>th</sup> AW and distribution of its aircraft and personnel.
- d. Result: The changes in significant cost/savings data are displayed in the table below with the most significant presented in **bold** font. The AF Recommendation COBRA data is presented in the first row for comparison to the Excursion results displayed in the second row in **blue**. This row displays the cost/savings results from the COBRA Model for only the actions associated with the 911<sup>th</sup> AW.

Scenario	Payback Period (Years)	Costs/Savings (\$K)*				
		20 - Year NPV	1-Time	Personnel (2006 - 2011)	Total (2006 - 2011)	Annual Total Recurring
USAF 0122V3 (316.3)	Immediate	-2,706,756	90,101	-772,995	-815,558	-200,497
<b>Community Excursion 1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>-144,323</b>	<b>47,169</b>	<b>-36,464</b>	<b>-1,715</b>	<b>-14,826</b>

\* Negative numbers represent savings.

- e. Discussion: As the comparison demonstrates, the Pittsburgh Only action is a part of the scenario that generates costs, but the 3-year payback still makes it financially attractive.

<b>C130H FY04 CPFH Final Execution Rates</b>	
<b>Unit</b>	<b>BQ/FAS</b>
Milwaukee	\$1,722
Niagara	\$1,956
Maxwell	\$2,224
Dobbins	\$2,145
Peterson	\$1,709
Youngstown	\$1,751
Pittsburgh	\$1,494
	<b>\$1,857</b>
	<b>Average CPFH</b>

**Notes:**

Command funded @ \$2699 total CPFH Rate

CPFH execution rates are based upon total costs divided by total flying hours flown

BQ is the Accounting System used to report total costs, i.e. DLRs, Consumable items,

CPFH GPC FAS "Purple Hub" is the system used to report Aviation fuel consumption

and costs Minn-St Paul not reflected, unit had C130E acft in FY04