



DEFENSE BASE CLOSURE AND REALIGNMENT COMMISSION  
2521 SOUTH CLARK STREET, SUITE 600  
ARLINGTON, VA 22202  
TELEPHONE: 703-699-2950  
FAX: 703-699-2735

July 13, 2005  
CWF #2

Chairman:  
The Honorable Anthony J. Principi

Commissioners:  
The Honorable James H. Billray  
The Honorable Philip E. Coyle, III  
Admiral Harold W. Gehman, Jr., USN (Ret.)  
The Honorable James V. Hansen  
General James T. Hill, USA (Ret.)  
General Lloyd W. Newton, USAF (Ret.)  
The Honorable Samuel K. Skinner  
Brigadier General Sue Ellen Turner, USAF (Ret.)

Executive Director:  
Charles Battaglia

Mr. Bob Meyer  
Director  
BRAC Clearinghouse  
1401 Oak St.  
Rosslyn VA 22209

Dear Mr. Meyer:

*I respectfully request a written response from the Department of Defense concerning:*

- Base Closure & Realignment Commission question*
- Question for the record*
- Community input for Portsmouth Naval Shipyard*
- COBRA run*
- Other - Request a breakout of Criteria 1 through 4 scores for all four Naval Shipyards*

*I would appreciate your response by July 18, 2005. Please provide a control number for this request and do not hesitate to contact me if I can provide further information concerning this request.*

*Yours sincerely,*

Frank Cirillo  
Director  
Review & Analysis



**DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY**  
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY  
1000 NAVY PENTAGON  
WASHINGTON DC 20350-1000

13 July 2005

The Honorable Anthony J. Principi  
Chairman  
Defense Base Closure and Realignment Commission  
2521 South Clark Street, Suite 600  
Arlington, VA 22202

Dear Chairman Principi:

This is in response to the July 13, 2005 inquiry (Code CWF#2) from Mr. Frank Cirillo of your staff requesting a breakout of Criteria 1 through 4 scores for all four Naval Shipyards. This response has been coordinated with the Industrial Joint Cross Service Group (IJCSG).

The IJCSG developed and conducted the Military Value (MV) analysis that is documented in their Military Value Analysis Report. This report is available on the defense link web site at:

[http://www.defenselink.mil/brac/admin\\_documentation/IJCSG/Signed%20Military%20Value%20Plan.pdf](http://www.defenselink.mil/brac/admin_documentation/IJCSG/Signed%20Military%20Value%20Plan.pdf).

The MV scores for each of the four Naval Shipyards are 'broken down' by Criteria, attributes and metrics and attached as enclosures.

I trust this information satisfactorily addresses your concerns. If we can be of further assistance, please let me know.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Anne Rathmell Davis".

Anne Rathmell Davis  
Special Assistant to the Secretary of the Navy  
for Base Realignment and Closure

Enclosures:  
As Stated

ActivityId	Score	CriteriaWeight	CriteriaScore	AttributeWeight	AttributeScore	MetricWeight	MetricScore	QuestionWeight	Weighted QuestionScore	SourceQuestionID	Question Score
NAVSHIPYD_NORFOLK_VA	0.733884958	0.25	0.189363895	0.25	0.206698745	0.35	0.35	1	1	Q1	1
						0.25	0.25	1	1	Q2	1
						0.25	0.151794979	1	0.607179917	Q3	0.607179917
						0.15	0.075	1	0.5	Q4	0.5
				0.3	0.261176471	1	0.870588235	Q5	0.870588235		
				0.25	0.25	1	1	Q6	1		
				0.25	0	1	0	Q7	0		
				0.2	0.2	1	1	Q8	1		
				0.4	0.36097561	1	0.902439024	Q9	0.902439024		
				0.35	0.329467053	1	0.941334438	Q10	0.941334438		
				0.25	0.090231736	1	0.360926945	Q11	0.360926945		
				0.45	0.418710151	1	0.930467002	Q12	0.930467002		
		0.25	0.181301457	1	0.725205829	0.3	0.132962819	1	0.443209396	Q13	0.443209396
		0.1				0.064871482	1	0.648714825	Q14	0.648714825	
		0.1				0.065131965	1	0.651319648	Q15	0.651319648	
		0.05				0.043529412	1	0.870588235	Q16	0.870588235	
		0.45				0.418710151	1	0.930467002	Q17	0.930467002	
		0.05				0.02216047	1	0.443209396	Q18	0.443209396	
		0.15				0.097307224	1	0.648714825	Q19	0.648714825	
		0.1				0.065131965	1	0.651319648	Q20	0.651319648	
		0.25				0.217647059	1	0.870588235	Q21	0.870588235	
		0.3				0.270731707	1	0.902439024	Q22	0.902439024	
		0.2				0.188266888	1	0.941334438	Q23	0.941334438	
		0.5				0.180463473	1	0.360926945	Q24	0.360926945	
		0.2	0.213437314	0.45	0.369430591	0.118215398	0.35	1	1	Q25	1
		0.118215398				0.35	1	0	Q26	0	
		0.118215398				0.3	0.241076986	0.5	0.303589958	Q27	0.607179917
		0.118215398	0.5	0.5	0.5	Q28	0.5				
		0.2	0.149782293	0.4	0.360995201	0.2	0.199461566	1	0.997307832	Q29	0.997307832
		0.5				0.451219512	1	0.902439024	Q30	0.902439024	
		0.4				0.376533775	1	0.941334438	Q31	0.941334438	
		0.1				0.074734716	1	0.747347155	Q32	0.747347155	
		0.4				0.188454696	1	0.47113674	Q33	0.47113674	
0.4	0.188454696	1				0.47113674	Q33	0.47113674			

ActivityID	Score	CriteriaWeight	CriteriaScore	AttributeWeight	AttributeScore	MetricWeight	MetricScore	QuestionWeight	Weighted QuestionScore	SourceQuestionID	Question Score
NAVSHIPYD_AND_IMF_PEARL_HARBOR_HI	0.620764763	0.25	0.13375351	0.25	0.184706075	0.35	0.089765232	1	0.256472092	Q1	0.256472092
						0.25	0.249059067	1	0.996236267	Q2	0.996236267
						0.25	0.25	1	1	Q3	1
						0.15	0.15	1	1	Q4	1
				0.3	0.261176471	1	0.870588235	Q5	0.870588235		
				0.25	0.076923077	1	0.307692308	Q6	0.307692308		
				0.25	0	1	0	Q7	0		
				0.2	0.030607287	1	0.153036437	Q8	0.153036437		
				0.4	0.317073171	1	0.792682927	Q9	0.792682927		
				0.25	0.165954549	1	0.623099461	Q10	0.623099461		
				0.25	0.128660214	1	0.514640855	Q11	0.514640855		
				0.45	0.306818182	1	0.681818182	Q12	0.681818182		
		0.25	0.144397548	1	0.57759019	0.3	0.149367352	1	0.497891174	Q13	0.497891174
						0.1	0.040793133	1	0.407931331	Q14	0.407931331
						0.1	0.037082111	1	0.370821114	Q15	0.370821114
						0.05	0.043529412	1	0.870588235	Q16	0.870588235
						0.45	0.306818182	1	0.681818182	Q17	0.681818182
						0.05	0.024894559	1	0.497891174	Q18	0.497891174
		0.3	0.178159093	0.45	0.291434225	0.15	0.0611897	1	0.407931331	Q19	0.407931331
						0.1	0.037082111	1	0.370821114	Q20	0.370821114
						0.25	0.217647059	1	0.870588235	Q21	0.870588235
						0.3	0.237804878	1	0.792682927	Q22	0.792682927
						0.2	0.124619892	1	0.623099461	Q23	0.623099461
						0.5	0.257320428	1	0.514640855	Q24	0.514640855
						0.35	0.127593004	1	0.36455144	Q25	0.36455144
						0.35	0	1	0	Q26	0
		0.2	0.085518601	0.3	0.3	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	Q27	1
						0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	Q28	1
		0.2	0.164454612	0.4	0.297619722	0.2	0.124653339	1	0.623266695	Q29	0.623266695
						0.5	0.396341463	1	0.792682927	Q30	0.792682927
						0.4	0.249239784	1	0.623099461	Q31	0.623099461
						0.1	0.098468057	1	0.984680566	Q32	0.984680566
						0.4	0.4	1	1	Q33	1
0.4	0.4					1	1	Q33	1		

ActivityId	Score	CriteriaWeight	CriteriaScore	AttributeWeight	AttributeScore	MetricWeight	MetricScore	QuestionWeight	Weighted QuestionScore	SourceQuestionID	Question Score
NAVSHIPYD_PORTSMOUTH_NH	0.64443006	0.25	0.140538402	0.25	0.06903714	0.35	0.014399373	1	0.041141067	Q1	0.041141067
						0.25	0.089567245	1	0.358268979	Q2	0.358268979
						0.25	0.122181942	1	0.488727767	Q3	0.488727767
						0.15	0.05	1	0.333333333	Q4	0.333333333
				0.3	0.289411765	1	0.964705882	Q5	0.964705882		
				0.25	0.019230769	1	0.076923077	Q6	0.076923077		
				0.25	0.148759053	1	0.595036213	Q7	0.595036213		
				0.2	0.099919028	1	0.499595142	Q8	0.499595142		
				0.4	0.380487805	1	0.951219512	Q9	0.951219512		
				0.25	0.21445616	1	0.649533813	Q10	0.649533813		
				0.25	0.25	1	1	Q11	1		
		0.45	0.16993374	1	0.377630533	Q12	0.377630533				
		0.3	0.232447357	1	0.774824523	Q13	0.774824523				
		0.1	0.1	1	1	Q14	1				
		0.1	0.1	1	1	Q15	1				
		0.05	0.048235294	1	0.964705882	Q16	0.964705882				
		0.45	0.16993374	1	0.377630533	Q17	0.377630533				
		0.05	0.038741226	1	0.774824523	Q18	0.774824523				
		0.45	0.314933146	1	1	Q19	1				
		0.1	0.1	1	1	Q20	1				
		0.25	0.241176471	1	0.964705882	Q21	0.964705882				
		0.3	0.285365854	1	0.951219512	Q22	0.951219512				
		0.2	0.129906763	1	0.649533813	Q23	0.649533813				
		0.5	0.5	1	1	Q24	1				
		0.35	0.325274622	1	0.929356062	Q25	0.929356062				
		0.35	0.35	1	1	Q26	1				
		0.3	0.148309165	0.5	0.244363883	Q27	0.488727767				
				0.5	0.25	Q28	0.5				
		0.2	0.172025512	1	0.860127561	Q29	0.860127561				
		0.5	0.475609756	1	0.951219512	Q30	0.951219512				
		0.4	0.334169313	1	0.649533813	Q31	0.649533813				
		0.1	0.1	1	1	Q32	1				
		0.4	0	1	0	Q33	0				

ActivityId	Score	CriteriaWeight	CriteriaScore	AttributeWeight	AttributeScore	MetricWeight	MetricScore	QuestionWeight	Weighted QuestionScore	SourceQuestionID	Question Score		
NAVSHIPYD_PUGET_SOUND_WA	0.747989505	0.25	0.165226883	0.25	0.138651317	0.35	0.070961642	1	0.202747547	Q1	0.202747547		
						0.25	0.142601502	1	0.570406006	Q2	0.570406006		
						0.25	0.191042127	1	0.764168507	Q3	0.764168507		
						0.15	0.15	1		Q4	1		
						0.3	0.3	1		Q5	1		
				0.5	0.313461538	0.25	0.076923077	1	0.307692308	Q6	0.307692308		
						0.25	0.25	1		Q7	1		
						0.2	0	1	0	Q8	0		
						0.4	0.4	1		Q9	1		
						0.35	0.35	1		Q10	1		
		0.25	0.237092816	1	0.948371265	0.25	0.085178698	1	0.340714791	Q11	0.340714791		
						0.45	0.45	1		Q12	1		
						0.3	0.3	1		Q13	1		
						0.1	0.082104403	1	0.821044033	Q14	0.821044033		
						0.1	0.066266862	1	0.662668622	Q15	0.662668622		
				0.45	0.42274056	0.15	0.123156605	0.05	0.05	1		Q16	1
								0.45	0.45	1		Q17	1
								0.05	0.05	1		Q18	1
								0.15	0.123156605	1	0.821044033	Q19	0.821044033
								0.1	0.066266862	1	0.662668622	Q20	0.662668622
		0.3	0.22260582	0.35	0.234625088	0.25	0.25	1		Q21	1		
						0.3	0.3	1		Q22	1		
						0.2	0.2	1		Q23	1		
						0.5	0.170357396	1	0.340714791	Q24	0.340714791		
				0.2	0.084653752	0.35	0.271143484	0.35	0	1	0.774695669	Q25	0.774695669
								0.35	0	1	0	Q26	0
								0.3	0.152125276	0.5	0.382084253	Q27	0.764168507
								0.3	0.152125276	0.5	0.125	Q28	0.25
		0.2	0.123063986	0.4	0.385060307	0.2	0.119205653	1	0.596028266	Q29	0.596028266		
						0.5	0.5	1		Q30	1		
						0.4	0.4	1		Q31	1		
						0.1	0.062650768	1	0.626507678	Q32	0.626507678		
						0.4	0.11105397	1	0.277634924	Q33	0.277634924		