Dayton
Development
Coalition

A Partnership For Regional Growth

900 Kettering Tower
Dayton, Ohio 45423
(937) 222-4422
(937) 222-1323 fax
www.daytonregion.com

178th Fighter Wing, Springfield-Beckley Airport

DoD BRAC recommends realigning Springfield-Beckley Municipal Airport Air Guard Station, OH. Distribute the 178th Fighter Wing's F-16 aircraft.

Dayton-Springfield Recommendations:

- **Construction Joint Reserve Component Training Center at Springfield-Beckley Municipal Airport**
- **Maintain F-16 Fighter Training Mission at 178 FW FTU until no longer programmatically needed by the Air Force (AETC).**

Rationale:

- The BRAC RC-Pat (Reserve Component- Process Action Team) approved and supports the construction of a Reserve Component Center at Springfield-Beckley Municipal Airport. The Reserve Component Center will be built on land adjacent to the 178 FW RTU and will support the joint use of facilities such as the medical training facility, mobility processing areas, dining hall, vehicle maintenance facility, fuels storage systems, classrooms, and other common use areas like parking. BRAC does not change this RC Joint Use Concept and it is independent of the 178 FW FTU, Springfield ANG Base issue. The facility construction to support the Army National Guard and the Army Reserve would be on land contiguous the real estate of the 178 FW RTU.
- **Recommend the 178 FW F-16 FTU be maintained as an F-16 fighter training mission location.**
- **The BRAC justification for realigning the Springfield-Beckley Airport improperly identifies Lackland as the only ANG F-16 Flying Training Unit.**
- **The Springfield FTU is a critical link in meeting the Air Force pilot production requirements of 1100 pilots per year for the foreseeable future. Nothing has changed this requirement.**

Eliminating this pilot training capacity at the 178 FW will damage the Air Force.

- **The BRAC COBRA model calculations for Springfield-Beckley Municipal Airport 178 FW FTU show the reduction of key personnel from the Operations and Maintenance areas as the primary cost savings for 2007, and beyond. This reduction of key pilot training personnel that are needed to train F-16 pilots at the 178 FW FTU will not show a cost savings until 17 years after the personnel reduction is achieved.**

- **In 2025 (20 years after BRAC-05) the entire BRAC savings for the realignment of the 178 FW FTU only amounts to a total of $693,000. (Yet, it will take an $11,367,000 dollar investment in 2007 to realign the 178 FW FTU).**

- **The cost of training one fighter pilot according to the AFI 65-503, Table A34-1, Representative Officer Aircrew Training Costs shows it cost $776,000 to graduate one pilot through the F-16 basic course. *(The total BRAC savings generated after 20 years by eliminating the 178 FW F-16 FTU in 2007 is less than it cost to train one F-16 pilot to a basic level).***

- **If the reduction of these key operations and maintenance personnel at the 178 FW FTU is slipped until 2010, or beyond, as shown in the BRAC data (The BRAC information shows some of the 178 FW FTU aircraft staying in place for pilot training through 2010) then there is no Net Present Value (NPV) cost savings generated according to the BRAC-05 COBRA data tables. The identified recurring cost savings for eliminating the key 178FW FTU training personnel is $2.673 million annually. Slipping the proposed reduction of key personnel by only one year beyond 2007, let alone the three years identified by BRAC, will actually cost the tax payer millions of dollars to accomplish and produce no savings. The proposed realign of the 178 FW FTU is very marginal for cost savings in 2007 and there is no payback in the 20 year look by the COBRA data analysis if these personnel changes are postponed beyond the first or second quarter of 2007.**

- **Don't BRAC the training capability at the 178 FW FTU, allow the 178 FW FTU to train pilots at Springfield, Ohio until there**

is no longer a need that is clearly defined by AETC production requirements.

- **The Air Force has identified the need to train 1100 fighter pilots per year for at least the next 5 to 7 years. The 178 FW FTU is a critical facility for meeting this need. When this forecast level of F-16 pilot production changes and is no longer needed, the Air Force can programmatically close down the F-16 FTU school house at Springfield-Beckley Municipal Airport and move the 178 FW FTU capacity to other missions of value to the warfighter.**

- **Don't realign the 18 PAA 178 FW FTU to capture what appears to be marginal Net Present Value savings in the COBRA data, but transform the 178 FW FTU when F-16 pilot production is no longer needed.**

- **There are significant errors in the Mission Capability Index (MCI) calculations for Springfield-Beckley Municipal Airport as shown below. Some of these errors occurred as a result of the timeframe and the way questions were asked for BRAC data collection in 2003. Since then there have been numerous construction projects completed at Springfield-Beckley Municipal Airport. These MCI errors are identified in the following information.**

Significant Errors in Fighter Mission Capability Index (MCI) Category

There are significant formula calculation errors in the Fighter Mission Compatibility Index (MCI) category for the 178th Fighter Wing. When properly recalculated, the Springfield-Beckley Airport moves from a previously incorrect #128 ranking to #24 in the entire US Air Force.

These errors include:

1. Formula 1245.00 (3.75 POINT ERROR) Proximity to Airspace Supporting Mission: the oversight of 24 hour NOTAM and Restricted airspace capability, combined with other errors in calculating our MOA's strengths, severely miscalculated the value of the this fine military airspace. Another 144 cubic miles of airspace could not be accounted for and was not included in the formula calculation. This airspace, less than 40 miles from the runway, is one of only three operating areas east of the Mississippi River with an upper

altitude limit of 50,000 feet MSL; and the supersonic airspace above 30,000 feet MSL was excluded from consideration. When combined with the soon to be activated Racer MOA, the unique geographical location of Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS represents tremendous potential and opportunity for inclusion in the Future Total Force. These areas will support F-22, F-35, Unmanned Combat Aerial Vehicles (UCAVs), GPS Guided Joint Direct Attack Munition (JDAM), Laser Guided Bomb (LGB) and Small Diameter Bomb (SDB) employment. The extraordinary potential for synergy of these future weapon systems being tested in close proximity to Wright Patterson Air Force Base may not have been considered because there was no way to document these benefits to the Future Total Force in the BRAC process. Lastly, the close proximity to dozens of aerial refueling assets secured at Rickenbacker ANGB in Columbus, Ohio through 2040 was not included.

2. Formula 1246.00 (5.29 POINT ERROR) Proximity to Low Levels Supporting Mission: this formula was significantly miscalculated by DOD, ignoring dozens of IR and VR routes within 150 miles. There are not many other installations in the United States with access to as many low levels in close proximity to its home station as Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS. Unlike other parts of the country, practically every low level training route terminates in the same military and restricted operating areas detailed above yielding unprecedented value.

3. Formula 1271.00 (3.20 POINT ERROR) Prevailing Installation Weather Conditions: this formula was miscalculated by DOD using incomplete and misleading data. The apparent conclusion that Wright Patterson Air Force Base (only 8 air miles to the west of Springfield) has 33 better weather days per year seems to be a significant stretch. This is likely attributed to the use of reported vice realistic data as, unlike most every active duty base or regional international airport, our installation weather personnel are not "on station" 2465. As a result, Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS received no points in this category.

4. Formula 1233.00 (4.79 POINT ERROR) Sufficient Munitions Storage: the existence of standing courtesy storage agreements at Wright-Patterson Air Force Base is disregarded, ignoring the capability and value with no additional costs to the ANG or DOD.

5. Formula 8.00 (0.74 POINT ERROR) Ramp Area and Serviceability: DOD data suggest that Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS only possesses ramp space for 24 fighter aircraft. This was reportedly based upon a satellite photo used in their determination; unfortunately, that photo was several years old. Currently, the installation has an additional brand new 18 parking spot ramp, as well as 2 brand new arming areas with 6 spots each, for an additional 30 spots and a total capability of parking 54 fighter aircraft. Further, the new ramp design allows for several more parking spots to be added between the new ramp and

the new arming area thanks to the foresight of the 178th Fighter Wing. DOD states that the cost to add a second squadron is $45,300,000, yet their estimate is more than $20,000,000 in error – and a large part of this error can be attributed to this oversight. This resulted in the installation receiving 0 points for what might be considered one of the finest fighter ramps in the ANG. Though the DOD calculation was in error, worse yet is the slighted formula itself which does not allow any sliding scale points for ramp space between 66k and 174k square yards (the next square yardage level required to achieve significantly more points in this category). This inconsistent calculation (there were other formulas that used sliding point scales) favored active duty over Air National Guard bases (and Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS) who have long remained disciplined in building sustaining only what is required for mission accomplishment.

6. Formula 1232.00 (2.44 POINT ERROR) Sufficient Explosive-sited Parking: DOD erred in their own estimate of 24 parking spots, with the correct number being 54 available. That miscalculation further misrepresented Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS by ignoring the existence of explosive sited parking. The fact that our installation is now an AETC operation means that the base does not have a current need for this siting. But that does not mean we are not capable. The original 24 aircraft parking spots at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS were previously certified for explosive siting as recently as 1998 when it was an F-16 General Purpose (GP) fighter unit. It would only take a few weeks (worst case) to receive renewed explosive siting certification. Additionally, all 30 additional parking spots meet all explosive siting design requirements; yet the true 54 aircraft explosive siting capability at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS goes completely unaccounted for in the DOD's recommendation.

7. Formula 1221.00 (0.32 POINT ERROR) Hangar Capability Small Aircraft: the formula drew data from a misleading question, and incorrectly summarized the storage capability of F-15 sized aircraft at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS. Correcting the reporting error would result in additional Fighter MCI points.

8. Formula 1235.00 (1.49 POINT ERROR) Installation Pavement Quality: airfield ramp, apron, runway and taxiway additions improvements at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS are so new that PCN and ACN data has only now become available – a full year after BRAC data collection began. The airport and its aprons taxiways runways can handle the absolute maximum number of passes for any aircraft, ranging in size and weight from every class of fighter to C-17; the result is absolutely no deficiency nor degradation in pavement quality. Unfortunately, this is overlooked in the formula calculation. This error does not reflect the superior infrastructure already in place at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS which can meet DOD requirements of hosting 6 x C-17 aircraft.

9. Formula 1205.10 (1.88 POINT ERROR) Buildable Acres for Industrial Growth: the current land lease at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS offers (at a minimum) an additional 167.9 acres in long term lease options through 2048, with 228.3 total acres secured in the already approved long range installation site plan. That the 178th Fighter Wing is not currently paying for the land grossly devalues and underestimates the buildable acreage upon which industrial growth could easily be erected. Agreements are already in place with the local government, and the land has been secured committed exclusively for ANG use. The installation frontage road has even been committed to future Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS exclusive use to further enhance the already substantial force protection capabilities currently in place. Visually comparing bases which survived DOD's recommendation using any commercially available overhead satellite imagery program reveals the miscalculation made in this formula. Moreover, this error resulted in significant points lost in many other MCI categories as well.

10. Formula 1205.20 (1.88 POINT ERROR) Buildable Acres for Air Operations Growth: the installation received lower scores not once but twice in the gross miscalculation of this formula as well. All subjects detailed above in Formula 1205.10 are exactly the same, resulting in misleading and significantly data errors and misrepresentation of Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS's capacity for air operations growth.

11. Formula 1241.00 (0.44 POINT ERROR) Ability to Support Large-Scale Mobility: as with Pavement Quality, the PCN and ACN data were not available during BRAC data calls for the countless new improved paved surfaces on the installation. Research of newly published data reveals that Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS is capable of the maximum large-scale mobility capacity, defined by DOD as the ability to support 6 x C-17's.

    MPT AGS has long used courtesy storage of live weapons at Wright Patterson AFB, and to needlessly construct a facility here would have been unwise and a waste of taxpayer dollars; yet, this decision ultimately resulted in a deficiency rather than a strength. Further, the 178th Fighter Wing can stage Air Sovereignty Alert (ASA) missions out of Wright Patterson Air Force Base without dislocating any personnel, yet this is not even considered. Few ANG bases can tout such a capability, and the cost savings to DOD combined with the quality of life benefits for aircrew and maintenance personnel are enormous.

Other Significant anomalies exist:

1. The COBRA model was found to be flawed and in error. The calculations do not take into account the cost of human capital and the very expensive cost to reconstitute or replicate their training. The COBRA model does not address

the correct salaries of those assigned to supporting flying operations at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS. Further, support personnel such as civilian simulator and ground training school house personnel aren't even included in the criterion, and hence the calculation itself. This becomes problematic when the COBRA model showed human capital leaving in FY07 but the aircraft remaining until FY10 (an additional three years). Currently, Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS has F-16 student PFT training loads scheduled through FY08. The end result is a $13,062,000 error in purported DOD cost savings estimates. Ultimately, disbanding the 178th Fighter Wing and terminating flying operations at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS will cost the American taxpayer $12,362,000, and will likely never result in the previously reported low cost savings of $700,000 in 17 years. Worse, when the 225 full-time federal jobs necessary to meet DOD recommendations for continued flying operations through 2010 are considered, an actual $49,406,625 error was made ($73,195 per year times 225 employees). This entire scenario completely calls into question the accuracy of the COBRA model itself.

2. The local community is severely impacted. Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS is the number 8 employer in Clark County, Ohio and the economic impact will be significant. Worse yet is that the bases and communities gaining our F-16's possess significantly more business activity and population base supporting their local community than Springfield, Ohio. Our total job loss among a local population of 67,753 results in a 0.6% loss, yet the redistribution of these positions as detailed in the DOD recommendation doesn't even amount to a 0.1% net gain for those three communities combined. In fact, the job loss relative to our population is 34 times greater than the gain experienced by those three communities. Even more disturbing is the oversight of actual jobs lost by disbanding the 178th Fighter Wing; in reality, 450 full and part-time Federal jobs will be lost – not the 291 jobs claimed by DOD. This significant discrepancy is the result of DOD overlooking contractor (Lockheed Martin L3 Communications personnel) and state employees (firefighters, tower personnel, weather forecasters, etc). The decision appears to have an unfair negative effect on a community with considerable dependence on the income of personnel assigned to Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS.

3. The DOD's claim that Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS is an ideal selection for realignment is untrue. The installation is much more ideally suited for conversion back to a General Purpose F-16 Combat unit. The best timing for this conversion would come at the expiration of the Air Force's requirement for the 178th Fighter Wing to serve in its current assignment as an F-16 Formal Training Unit. Ultimately, the installation is well positioned to become a 48 PAA F-35 Joint Strike Fighter General Purpose unit as part of the Future Total Force, currently under consideration and being drafted by DOD for implementation. To wit:

4. Current 178th Fighter Wing manning is at 109.08%; that's #1 in Ohio and #2 in the entire Air National Guard nationwide. Units on the list to which our aircraft are to be reassigned have as much as 20% lower in total manning percentages. In fact, current aircrew manning already in place at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS would fulfill 100% of the projected full-time pilot requirements for a 24 PAA General Purpose F-16 or Joint Strike Fighter F-35 squadron as calculated by DOD. Not one full-time pilot needs to be trained or moved to the Springfield, Ohio area to support this mission as we're already in place, well trained, and highly experienced. The current investment in our cadre of instructor pilots alone is estimated to be more than $120,000,000, and is likely to be lost in its near entirety should DOD's recommendation be approved.

5. The 178th Fighter Wing also has 78% of projected full-time aircraft maintenance personnel manning required for a 24 PAA squadron as calculated by DOD already in place. 80% of our maintenance personnel are 5 level or above, with 74% at 7 level or above. Our experience and performance are so highly ranked that our 15.49 UTE rate is practically equivalent to the 15.58 Active Duty Air Force Block 30 UTE rate. DOD should have considered that active duty Air Force units employ two fully manned maintenance shifts while Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS's only employs one to one-and-a-third maintenance shifts. This is made possible by our extensive experience and efficiency, something the BRAC process completely overlooked.

6. Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS has served numerous other units by relieving their past and present manning deficiencies, with aircrew maintenance support personnel deploying across the nation and overseas to fill gaps left by insufficient recruiting and retention. Further, several national leadership positions have been filled by former members of the 178th Fighter Wing, representing an irreplaceable success story in the defense of our nation.

7. Given the manning situation detailed above, the assumption that personnel at a realigned facility such as Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS would simply "move with the aircraft" to another location in order to support the forecasted increase in that unit's full-time employment is neither cost effective nor realistic. At best, it displaces the most people while at the same time ignoring the considerable cost and pain associated with relocation. More likely, a significant loss will be experienced as practically every unit member has close ties to their local community, with many living in the Columbus and Cincinnati areas as well. Many members of the 178th Fighter Wing who did not begin their career at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS have moved here to be closer to their family and raise their children where they grew up.

8. A new state of the art operations building was recently completed ($7,000,000 investment in 2002 $12,600,000 value in 2010), and is already capable of completely housing two separate 24 PAA F-16 or F-35 JSF General Purpose

squadrons for a total of 48 PAA fighter aircraft and all associated aircrew personnel. Further, the facility is already Sensitive Compartmentalized Information Facility (aka SCIF) capable, an extremely costly requirement which will have to be duplicated elsewhere. The 178th Fighter Wing has spent years designing and configuring the building, and in my estimation there are few other operations buildings as functional and Joint Strike Fighter ready as that Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS.

9. Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS is one of only three ANG units in the United States to possess three or more flight simulators, and the only installation in the nation with 4 x Block 30 F-16C devices. Our scheduled 4000 square foot simulator expansion, previously approved and ready for construction, can house 4 x full 360 degree field of view simulator devices, complete with a state of the art brief and debrief system, for less than $3,000,000 ($1,500,000 in minor construction, and $1,500,000 in additional equipment). This facility, previously scheduled for completion in Spring 2006, is capable of sustaining not only local Formal Training Unit workloads, but can also support up to 480 active duty Air Force and ANG pilots per year in fully immersive air combat simulation training. Our simulator facility has recently received a significant upgrade in long haul network connectivity, permitting our training devices to simultaneously connect to any other Army, Navy, Air Force, or Marine simulator around the world. The value of this impressive Distributed Mission Training (DMT) capability is further highlighted when compared to that which Air Force and ANG aircrew receive at the Air Force Research Laboratory in Mesa, Arizona. That facility only supports air-to-air mission training, whereas our facility permits full employment in all F-16 mission areas (air-to-air, air-to-ground, Night Vision Goggle, Laser Guided Bombs with Targeting Pods, etc). All of this is conducted using a photo-realistic terrain database of several critical areas of concern in the Global War on Terror, including North Korea, Iraq and Afghanistan. Even better, this training represents a potential $15,360,000 annual flying hour savings—not to mention the wear and tear on our aircraft inventory.

10. Extensive additions and renovations have occurred since conversion to a Formal Training Unit (FTU) in 1998. The total expenditure to date has exceeded $50M, and is significantly greater when forecasted in 2010 Dollars. If the 178th Fighter Wing flying operation is disbanded and is reconstituted at other locations, many if not all of the facilities and infrastructure improvements procured in the last 5 years at Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS will need to be completed at other installations at those installations. Many of these same gaining bases already have plans on the books to construct these same facilities, representing tens of millions in potentially wasted taxpayer Dollars. These facilities and infrastructure improvements include:

    - New explosive sited arming areas and an F-35 Joint Strike Fighter capable hush house (the only one in the ANG, a combined $4,800,000 investment

in 2003 $8,100,000 value in 2010). Note – Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS has one of only four 75,000 pound thrust tie downs systems in the United States. The remaining three locations are on active duty Air Force bases (Nellis, Eglin and Langley). This is a natural requirement for F-22 and F-35 Joint Strike Fighter aircraft and was purposefully designed and built with this capability in mind;

- New supply building ($4,900,000 investment in 1999 $10,000,000 value in 2010);
- New dining and medical facility ($4,400,000 investment in 1995 $10,600,000 value in 2010);
- New firehouse ($5,600,00 investment in 2005 $8,500,000 value in 2010);
- New civil engineering building ($4,200,000 investment in 2000 $8,200,000 value in 2010);
- New front gate with complete force protection ($300,000 investment in 2005 $600,000 value in 2010);
- New control tower ($4,200,000 invested in 2005 $6,100,000 value in 2010)
- New parking ramp ($4,250,000 investment in 2003 $6,800,000 million value in 2010);
- New taxiway barriers runway overruns ($5,200,000 invested in 2002 $8,800,000 value in 2010);
- New Non-Destructive Inspection (NDI) facility ($700,000 invested in 2003 $1,200,000 value in 2010). Note – Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS does NDI work for several other ANG bases. This necessary capability would have to be duplicated elsewhere, yet this fact goes unmentioned in the DOD's recommendation;
- New airfield lighting ($1,200,000 invested in 2005 $1,600,000 value in 2010);
- New corrosion facility ($2,100,000 invested in 1999 $5,200,000 value in 2010);
- Total aircraft hangar renovation ($6,400,000 invested in 2003 $10,200,000 value in 2010);

- Extensive airfield perimeter force protection measures too numerous to detail.

11. The proximity to Wright Patterson Air Force Base is completely ignored. The Air Force seeks to institute a "community basing" concept at Burlington, Vermont; yet this overlooks the benefit to active duty personnel assigned to Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS of having access to the third largest Air Force Base in the United States as measured by active duty, civilian and contractor personnel. The hospital itself is expanding in size and scope, and the housing commissary exchange privileges constitute irreplaceable value. It is difficult to imagine another area better suited for consideration as the ideal geographical model for the community basing concept.

12. The value of the Air National Guard to the Homeland Security Mission and Global War on Terror (GWOT) is extraordinary. Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS and the 178th Fighter Wing epitomize this in every single way, from infrastructure, to growth capacity, to the countless professionals that have committed their lives to serving their nation, their state and their community. Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS is the number two fighter sortie generation squadron in the Air National Guard, second only to another ANG fighter wing with three times the number of aircraft. We're the number one F-16 student producer since inception as a Formal Training Unit in 1998, even training other Active Duty instructors from Luke AFB in Night Vision Goggles (NVG) when the Air Force could not meet their own requirements.

13. Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS graduates its F-16 students in 16 fewer training days than does the Active Duty using an imbedded syllabus; the result is a graduate fully qualified in Targeting Pod (TGP) employment who needs only one home station certification flight to become an NVG combat wingman. As a result of our incredible efficiency, Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS was only credited for producing one student per syllabus. In contrast, Luke AFB, which re-enrolls their students twice in order to complete two additional follow on courses (TGP and NVG) was credited for three times the student flow as Springfield-Beckley MPT AGS. This is hardly fair since we produce a more combat capable student in a shorter time period using a more effective syllabus. The superior experience level of our Instructor Pilots and maintenance personnel makes all of this possible, and the resulting UTE rate detailed herein. In stark contrast, the Active Duty chose not to adopt our approach given their lesser experience levels among Instructor Pilots and maintenance personnel – a testament to our ability to excel on many levels.