Candidate Recommendation # DON-0033R

Candidate Recommendation: Close Naval Submarine Base (SUBASE) New London, CT. Relocate its assigned submarines, ARDM-4, and NR-1 along with their dedicated personnel, equipment and support to SUBASE Kings Bay, GA and Naval Station (NAVSTA) Norfolk, VA. Relocate the intermediate submarine repair function to Ship Intermediate Repair Activity Norfolk, VA, Naval Shipyard Norfolk, VA, and Trident Refit Facility Kings Bay, GA. Relocate the Naval Submarine School and Center for Submarine Learning to SUBASE Kings Bay. Relocate Naval Security Group Activity (NSGA) Groton, CT to NAVSTA Norfolk and consolidate with NSGA Norfolk at NAVSTA Norfolk. Relocate Commander Naval Submarine Group Two to NAVSTA Norfolk, VA. Consolidate Naval Submarine Medical Research Laboratory (NSMRL) Groton, CT, with Naval Medical Research Center (NMRC) at Walter Reed Army Medical Center Forest Glenn Annex, MD. Relocate Naval Undersea Medical Institute (NUMI) Groton, CT to Naval Air Station (NAS) Pensacola, FL and Fort Sam Houston, TX. Consolidate COMNAVREG Northeast, New London, CT with COMNAVREG, Mid-Atlantic, Norfolk, VA.

Justification: The berthing capacity at SUBASE New London is excess to the capacity required to support the Force Structure Plan. Sufficient capacity and fleet dispersal is maintained with the East Coast submarine fleet homeports of NAVSTA Norfolk and SUBASE Kings Bay. This closure will result in a capacity reduction of 16.25 Cruiser Equivalents (CGE) and the relocation of submarines at SUBASE New London to bases with a higher military value. This closure, combined with other closures in the Surface-Subsurface Operations function, results in the maximum reduction of excess capacity while increasing the average military value of the remaining bases in this functional area. The intermediate submarine repair function is relocated to SIMA Norfolk, Norfolk Naval Shipyard, and the Trident Refit Facility Kings Bay in support of the relocating submarines. Consolidating the NSMRL with assets at the Walter Reed Army Medical Center Forest Glenn Annex will create a DOD Center of Hyperbaric and Undersea Medicine that will increase synergy by consolidating previously separate animal and human research capabilities at a single location. The consolidation of COMNAVREG Northeast, New London, CT with COMNAVREG, Mid-Atlantic, Norfolk, VA, is in concert with Department of Navy efforts to reduce the number of Installation Management (IM) Regions from ten to six. Sufficient IM capability for CONUS resides within the remaining Regions. Consolidation of the Regions rationalizes regional management structure and allows for opportunities to collocate regional entities to align management concepts and efficiencies.

Payback: The total estimated one-time cost to the Department of Defense to implement this recommendation is $679.64 million. The net of all costs and savings during the implementation period is a cost of $345.44 million. Annual recurring savings to the Department after implementation are $192.77 million with a payback expected in three

years. The net present value of the costs and savings to the Department over 20 years is a savings of $1.58 billion.

Impacts:

Economic Impact on Communities: Assuming no economic recovery, this recommendation could result in a maximum potential reduction of 15,818 jobs (8,461 direct jobs and 7,357 indirect jobs) over the 2006-2011 period in the Norwich-New London, Connecticut Metropolitan Statistical Area, which is 9.38 percent of economic area employment.

Community Infrastructure: A review of community attributes indicates there are no issues regarding the ability of the infrastructure of the community to support missions, forces, and personnel.

Environmental Impact:

A review of environmental resource areas indicates there are no substantial environmental impacts occasioned by this recommendation. NAVSTA Norfolk is in Maintenance for 1-Hour Ozone and Marginal Non-attainment for Ozone 8-hour. An Air Conformity determination may be required. NAVSTA Norfolk reports additional impacts for Dredging, Marine Mammals, TES and Water Resources. There are no anticipated impacts to the resource areas of Cultural Resources, Land Use, Noise, Waste Management or Wetlands.

SUBASE Kings Bay is in attainment. The installation reports impacts for Dredging, Marine Mammals, TES and Water Resources. There are no anticipated impacts to the resource areas of Air Quality, Cultural Resources, Land Use, Noise, Waste Management or Wetlands.

NAS Pensacola is in attainment. It notes impacts to Cultural Resources, Waste Management and Wetlands. There are no impacts to the resource areas of Dredging, Land Use, Marine Mammals, Noise, TES, and Water Resources.

Walter Reed Medical Center-Forrest Glen Annex is in Severe Non-attainment for 1-Hour and 8-Hour Ozone and an Air Conformity determination will be required. Additional impacts to Land Use and Wetlands are noted. There are no impacts to the resource areas of Cultural Resources, Dredging, Marine Mammals, Noise, TES, Waste Management and Water Resources.

Ft Sam Houston is in attainment. Impacts to Cultural Resources, TES and Water Resources are noted. There are no impacts to the resource areas of Air Quality, Dredging, Marine Mammals, Noise and Waste Management.

Overall, there are no known environmental impediments to implementation of this recommendation.

This recommendation indicates impacts of costs at all the installations involved. The closing installation, SUBASE New London, reports costs of approximately $1 thousand for HAZMAT Procurement/HAZWASTE disposal, unidentified costs for closure of Treatment, Storage and Disposal Facilities and Controlled Industrial Facility and removal of existing HAZMAT (product in tanks, storage containers, fuel in abandoned pipelines, etc). NAVSTA Norfolk indicates impacts of costs to prevent disruption to the POTW requiring unidentified additional labor and disposal costs, increased waste disposal costs, $15 thousand for a dredging permit, $93 thousand for an environmental assessment for dredging, and $20 thousand for an Air Conformity determination for Sea Wolf projects. SUBASE Kings Bay indicates $8.2 million for Water, Sanitary/Wastewater and Oily Waste System Upgrades, $2 million for a Cumulative Environmental Assessment, $75 thousand for Hazardous Waste Response Satellite Sites and $375 thousand for updating environmental plans: Spill Prevention, Control and Countermeasure, Facility Response Plan, Hazardous Waste Management Plan, Integrated Natural Resources Management Plan, and Industrial Waste Water Management Plan. NAS Pensacola reports $5 thousand for HAZWASTE disposal, $30 thousand to modify the Title V Air permit and $150K for NEPA documentation (EA). Walter Reed indicates costs of $25 thousand to $75 thousand for Air Conformity, $100 to $500 thousand for new source review and permitting, $100 thousand for NEPA documentation (EA) and various Cultural/Tribal Resource costs from $500 to $40 thousand for site assessments. Ft Sam Houston indicates costs of $10 thousand for a programmatic agreement, $500 to $2 thousand for Tribal consults, $20 thousand to $2 million for TES management and $100 thousand for NEPA documentation (EA). These costs were included in the payback calculation. SUBASE New London reports $23.9M in environmental restoration costs. Because the Department has a legal obligation to perform environmental restoration regardless of whether an installation is closed, realigned, or remains open, this cost is not included in the payback calculation. This recommendation does not otherwise impact the costs of environmental restoration, waste management, or environmental compliance activities.

Attachments:

Supporting Information
COBRA Report
Economic Impact Report(s)
Installation Criterion 7 Profile(s)
Summary of Scenario Environmental Impacts Report

Candidate Recommendation # DON-0033R Supporting Information:

Potential Competing Recommendations: None. This recommendation incorporates IND-0037, which relocates the intermediate submarine repair function from SUBASE New London, elements of MED-0024 which relocates the Naval Submarine Medical Research Laboratory Groton, CT and consolidates it with the Naval Medical Research Center at the Walter Reed Army Medical Center Forest Glenn Annex, and elements of DON-0041 which consolidates COMNAVREG Northeast, New London, CT with COMNAVREG, Mid-Atlantic, Norfolk, VA.

Force Structure Capabilities: This recommendation ensures that the Department will retain necessary capabilities to support the Force Structure Plan. SUBASE New London has a capacity of 16.25 Cruiser Equivalents (CGE). The reduction in capacity is 3.8 percent of the capacity of all "active" Surface-Subsurface Operations installations

The 20-year force structure plan has a mix of 378 ships comprised of Aircraft Carriers (CV/CVN), Ballistic Missile Submarines /Guided Missile Submarines (SSBN/SSGN), Attack Submarines (SSN), Surface Combatants (CG, CG(X), DDG, DD(X), LCS, FFG), Amphibious Assault Ships (LHA, LHD, LPD, LPD-17, LSD, LSD(R)), Mine Countermeasures Ships (MCM, MHC), Patrol Craft (PC), Small Auxiliary Craft (ARS), and Large Auxiliary Craft (T-AOE(X), T-AVB, T-AK, T-AKR, T-AH). The size and projected operating pattern or in-port paradigm has been reviewed against available capacity to ensure sufficient facilities with the appropriate configuration are maintained.

The totality of candidate recommendations for the Surface-Subsurface Operations functions retains facilities that will be sufficient to ensure the Department will be able to support the force structure plan.

The Force Structure was not considered likely to affect Regional Support Activities unless there were major changes in the force concentration areas where the activities were located.

Military Value Analysis Results: SUBASE New London had a Military Value score of 50.69, which was equivalent to the mean Military Value score for all installations capable of performing the Surface-Subsurface Operations Function (50.64) and below the mean Military Value score of only the "active bases" (55.64). The closure of SUBASE New London would, therefore, result in an increase of the average Military Value of the remaining bases for the Surface-Subsurface Operations Function.

The closure of SUBASE New London will have no adverse impact on the Surface-Subsurface Operations function. Two possible receiver scenarios were reviewed: all submarines and NAVSUBSCOL to NAVSTA Norfolk and a split of submarines (determined by Commander Fleet Forces Command) between SUBASE Kings Bay and

NAVSTA Norfolk with NAVSUBSCOL to SUBASE Kings Bay. The result of military judgment and review of capacity data determined that the split of submarines between NAVSTA Norfolk and SUBASE Kings Bay with NAVSUBSCOL to SUBASE Kings Bay should be the receiving location for assets to be relocated from SUBASE New London. The reduction in strategic and operational flexibility associated with the single siting of all SSNs on the East Coast weighed strongly against selecting NAVSTA Norfolk as the single receiver site.

Arrayed Military Value Results for Surface-Subsurface Operations

Ranking	DoN Activity	Military Value
1	NS PEARL HARBOR HI	74.50
2	NS NORFOLK VA	67.51
3	NAVSHIPYD NORFOLK VA	64.03
4	SUBASE KINGS BAY GA	63.51
5	NS BREMERTON WA	63.25
6	SUBASE BANGOR WA	62.98
7	NS SAN DIEGO CA	61.43
8	NAS NORTH ISLAND CA	59.68
9	SUBASE SAN DIEGO CA	58.29
10	NAVMAG PEARL HARBOR	58.24
11	NAB LITTLE CREEK VA	55.90
12	NS MAYPORT FL	55.71
13	NS EVERETT WA	50.68
14	SUBASE NEW LONDON CT	50.68
15	NAVSHIPYD PORTSMOUTH NH	48.21
16	COMNAVMARIANAS GU	47.67
17	NAS PENSACOLA FL	45.85
18	BLOUNT ISLAND CMD JAX FL	45.78
19	WPNSTA YORKTOWN VA	44.91
20	WPNSTA CHARLESTON SC	43.31
21	NB VENTURA CTY PT MUGU CA	42.86
22	NS NEWPORT RI	42.36
23	NS INGLESIDE TX	42.23
24	NAS KEY WEST FL	40.59
25	WPNSTA EARLE COLTS NECK NJ	39.07
26	NAVORDTESTU CAPE CANAVERAL FL	37.71
27	NS PASCAGOULA MS	37.08
28	NSA PANAMA CITY FL	33.73
29	WPNSTA SEAL BEACH at CONCORD CA	30.82

Shaded Activities Represent "Non-Active" Bases

Regarding Hyperbaric and Undersea Medicine, this recommendation responds to the closure of SUBASE New London, CT. While the Naval Medical Research Center – Walter Reed Army Medical Center Forest Glen Annex has the lowest quantitative

military value, it was the military judgment of the Medical JCSG that the ability to consolidate human hyperbaric research of the Naval Submarine Medical Research Laboratory with the DOD animal hyperbaric program and other related R&D functions of the Naval Medical Research Center at WRAMC-FGA offered positive synergies. These synergies when considered with the expensive facilitization requirements, lack of consolidation savings, and necessity for DoD to support an additional vivarium, led to the judgment of the Medical JCSG that co-location of these functions at the Naval Medical Research Center – Walter Reed Army Medical Center Forest Glen Annex versus NAS Panama City, FL provides the highest overall military value to the Department.

Medical Dental RDA Sub-Function: ***Hyperbaric and Undersea Medicine Research***		
Activity	**Sub-function RDA MV score***	**Total RDA MV score**
Naval Experimental Diving Unit – NAS Panama City	24.54	24.54
Naval Submarine Medical Research Laboratory – SUBSHIP Groton CT	22.10	22.10
Naval Medical Research Center – WRAMC-FGA	1.12	26.86

**Pro-rated military value score for activity, based on percentage of workforce performing the function*

For Military Value Analysis results for Shipyard Intermediate Maintenance Activities, see attached.

COMNAVREG Northeast had a Military Value score of 59.9 which was below the mean Military Value score for all Regions performing Installation Management (60.86). The candidate recommendation would, therefore, result in an increase in the average Military Value for the remaining Regions for the Installation Management (IM) Function.

Arrayed Military Value Results for IM Regions:

Ranking	DoN Installation	Military Value Score
1	COMNAVREG MIDLANT	86.7
2	COMNAVREG SW	82.7
3	COMNAVDIST WASHINGTON	73.0
4	COMNAVREG SE	67.2
5	COMNAVREG NW	65.6
6	COMNAVREG HI	65.2
7	COMNAVREG NE	59.9
8	COMNAVREG MW	54.4
9	COMNAVREG GULF COAST	50.0
10	COMNAVMARIANAS	44.1
11	COMNAVREG SOUTH	41.1
12	COMNAVRESFORCOM	40.4

Capacity Analysis Results: For the Surface-Subsurface Operations function, current capacity is 355 Cruiser Equivalents (CGE). This is based on a maximum potential capacity of 578 CGEs that includes non-active bases (shipyards, weapon stations, and other bases not currently organized as an operational base). These non-operational bases are not suitable for homeporting surface and subsurface ships and thus are not considered excess capacity for this function. However, these bases are available to meet any surge or other emergent requirements due to operational tempo or need for homeport change flexibility. No-nesting allowances to accommodate ship maintenance and weapons handling, and allowances for pier modernization further reduce the operational base capacity to achieve the available capacity of 355 CGE. Surge is not a consideration for this function, as it would require additional ship construction to achieve a surge capability. Based on the 20-year force structure plan, factoring in the in-port paradigm (overall 72.6 percent), and removing forward deployed naval force ships and maritime pre-positioned ships, the capacity required is 267 CGE. Therefore, the excess capacity is 88 CGE.

Surface-Subsurface Operations Function - Capacity Analysis Results

Installation	Available Capacity (Cruiser Equivalents- CGE)
Active Homeports	
NAVSTA NORFOLK	97.25
NAVSTA SAN DIEGO	87
NAVSTA PEARL HARBOR	49.75
NAVSTA BREMERTON	14
NAVSTA MAYPORT	32.5
NAVPHIBASE LITTLE CREEK	27
NAS NORTH ISLAND	20
SUBASE NEW LONDON	**16.25**
NAVSTA INGLESIDE	13.5
SUBASE KINGS BAY	13.5
NAVSTA EVERETT	12
COMNAVMARIANAS GU	11
SUBBASE SAN DIEGO	10.5
WEPSTA EARLE	8
SUBASE BANGOR	7.75
NAVSTA PASCAGOULA	5.5
Total	425.5
WEAPSTAs	
WPNSTA CHARLESTON	12
NAVMAG PEARL HARBOR	4.5
WPNSTA YORKTOWN	3
NAVWPNSTA SEAL BCH DET CONCORD CA	3
Total	22.5
SHIPYARDS	
NAVSHIPYD NORFOLK	28.75
NAVSHIPYD PORTSMOUTH	16.25
NAVSHIPYD PEARL HARBOR	22
NAVSHIPYD PUGET SOUND	28
Total	95
OTHER	
NAS KEY WEST	8
NAS PENSACOLA	7.5
NAVSTA NEWPORT	5
NAVBASE VENTURA COUNTY CA	5
NAVORDTESTU	4
NAVSUPPACT PANAMA CITY	3
BLOUNT ISLAND CMD	2
Total	34.5
Non-Active Total	152

Grand Total	577.5

Medical/Dental RDA Sub-Function: Hyperbaric and Undersea Medicine Research						
Activity Name	**Current Usage**	**Current Capacity**	**Surge Rqmt**	**Capacity Available to Surge**	**Max Capacity**	**Excess Capacity**
Naval Submarine Medical Research Laboratory – SUBSHIP Groton CT	26	32	28.6	6	32	3.4
Naval Medical Research Center – WRAMC-FGA	9.86	10	10.84	0.14	10	-0.84
Naval Experimental Diving Unit – NAS Panama City	127	131	139.7	4	131	-8.7

For Capacity Analysis results for Shipyard Intermediate Maintenance Activities, see attached.

Management capacity to support customers was analyzed. Span of control and workload balance measures were utilized in conjunction with Military Value in order to determine closure alternatives. Since there is no stated capacity of Regional Support Activities, there was no measurement of excess capacity.