DCN: 8647

103-06A – AF - T – Community Input
Air Force – Tyndall Air Force Base – FL
BRAC COMMISSION – FY 2005
COFF:_____ DISPOSITION: Permanent

BAY COUNTY
Bay Defense Alliance

White papers responding to BRAC 2005 recommendations affecting Tyndall Air Force Base

DRAFT

June 2005

Provided by:
Mr. L.N. Dantzler
President, Bay Defense Alliance
P.O. Box 246
Lynn Haven, FL 32444
(850) 769-5082
larrydantzler@knology.net

Basis for Reconsideration of Realignment F100 Engine Repair from Tyndall AFB, Florida to New Orleans Air Reserve Station

2005 BRAC Recommendations:

F100 Engine Centralized Intermediate Repair Facilities

Recommendation: Realign Langley Air Force Base, VA; Tyndall Air Force Base, FL; and Jacksonville International Airport Air Guard Station, FL. Establish a Centralized Intermediate Repair Facility (CIRF) for F100 engines at Seymour Johnson Air Force Base, NC by realigning base-level F100 engine intermediate maintenance from Langley Air Force Base. Establish a CIRF for F100 engines at New Orleans Air Reserve Station, LA (Air National Guard unit) by realigning base-level F100 engine intermediate maintenance from Tyndall Air Force Base and Jacksonville Air Guard Station.

Justification: Realigning F100 engine maintenance from Tyndall and Jacksonville into a CIRF at New Orleans (AUG unit) establishes a southeast region CIRF that will service F100 engines for up to 96 F-15 aircraft of active duty and Air National Guard aircraft, complimenting other Air Force recommendations that increase New Orleans and Jacksonville to an optimum 24 aircraft squadron size. The Air Force considered both New Orleans and Jacksonville for the southeast CIRF, but analysis indicated New Orleans would require less construction than Jacksonville due to existing maintenance facilities. A CIRF at New Orleans can also potentially capitalize on capacity and recruitment of experienced maintenance technicians as a result of the recommended realignment of the New Orleans Reserve A-10 Mission.

Economic Impact on Communities: Assuming no economic recovery, this recommendation could result in a maximum potential reduction of 66 jobs (33 direct jobs and 33 indirect jobs) over the 2006-2011 period in the Panama City-Lynn Haven, FL, Metropolitan Statistical economic area, which is less than 0.1 percent of economic area employment.

Basis for Reconsideration of Realignment of F100 Engine Repair from Tyndall AFB to New Orleans Air Reserve Station

```
COBRA REALIGNMENT SUMMARY REPORT (COBRA v6.10) - Page 1/2
Data As Of 5/20/2005 8:16:30 AM, Report Created 5/20/2005 9:37:21 AM

Department          : USAF
Scenario File       : A:\COBRA USAF 0106V2 (908.2c1).CBR
Option Pkg Name     : COBRA USAF 0106V2 (908.2c1) Est. F100 CIRF (New Orleans)
Std Fctrs File      : C:\COBRA\COBRA 6.10\BRAC2005.SFF

Starting Year       : 2006
Final Year          : 2007
Payback Year        : 2016 (9 Years)
NPV in 2025($K)     : -7,146
1-Time Cost($K)     : 9,151
```

Net Costs in 2005 Constant Dollars ($K)

	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total	Beyond
MilCon	439	4,873	0	0	0	0	5,312	0
Person	0	-509	-961	-961	-961	-961	-4,351	-961
Overhd	76	-140	-197	-197	-197	-197	-853	-197
Moving	2,774	317	12	0	0	0	3,103	0
Mission	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Other	9	490	23	23	23	23	590	23
TOTAL	3,298	5,032	-1,123	-1,135	-1,135	-1,135	3,800	-1,135

We recommend that Tyndall AFB be considered as the Southeast Region CIRF for F100 Engines for the following reasons:

Tyndall AFB would provide a more geographically and economically efficient location for the Centralized Intermediate Repair Facility due to its proximity midway between both Jacksonville ANG and New Orleans ARB. It appears that only Jacksonville and New Orleans were considered for possible locations for the CIRF – not Tyndall AFB, which is approximately 300 miles from each installation. The COBRA data indicates that a scenario with the possibility of Tyndall as the CIRF was not considered.

Meanwhile, the $5.312 million in MILCON costs to prepare the New Orleans facility for F100 engine repair would be negated due to the ability of Tyndall AFB to absorb increased F100 maintenance at its existing facility. There would be no construction requirement at Tyndall AFB to absorb the CIRF activity.

Tyndall AFB is currently maintaining 181 F100 engines associated with 76 F-15s. Engine maintenance is housed in a 57,000 square foot facility with an adjacent storage building. Tyndall AFB is capable of absorbing the surge of increased F100 maintenance from New Orleans and Jacksonville and has the capacity to become the southeast region CIRF for F100 engine repair. Also, Tyndall AFB already has two hush houses currently in place while the New Orleans facility would require hush house relocation.

The majority of the F100 engine repair work at Tyndall AFB is performed under contract with DS|2. This contract runs through September 2009 and is not transferable to another location.

The F100 engine repair team at Tyndall AFB is currently exceeding Air Education and Training Command quality control metrics.

The DoD recommendation indicates that the New Orleans CIRF would be able to leverage vacated A-10 facilities and capitalize on personnel resources in New Orleans. However, COBRA data indicates that the A-10s are not scheduled to relocate until 2010 and the F100 CIRF will be implemented in 2007.

Shipping costs between the bases would also be minimized at Tyndall AFB due to its centralized location and the fact the Tyndall AFB will generate at least twice as many F100 Engines for repair as either New Orleans or Jacksonville. Using an estimate of shipments between bases, it is estimated that establishing an F100 CIRF at Tyndall AFB would reduce shipping costs by approximately half. (See cost breakdown in attached sheet.)

Request: The BRAC Commission re-examine this recommendation and consider Tyndall AFB as the location for the southeast F100 CIRF.

F100 ENGINE REPAIR

ASSUMPTIONS:

Number of F100 engines repaired by JAX ANG per year	40
Number of F100 engines repaired by N.O. ANG per year	40
Number of F100 engines repaired by Tyndall AFB per year	100
Handling and preparation for shipping cost (per engine)	$200

Freight Line costs for a 48 ft air ride flat bed trailer **

JAX to N.O.	$1,157
JAX to Tyndall	$750
Tyndall to JAX	$750
Tyndall to N.O.	$800
N.O. to JAX	$1,377
N.O. to Tyndall	$800

** Quote per Horizon Freight June 2005

Engines are shipped two to a trailer. This is the maximum, but occasionally could be shipped only one to a trailer. Shipping cost is the same for a dedicated trailer.

SCENARIO 1. MAKE NEW ORLEANS THE CIRF

Number of shipments

JAX to N.O.	20
N.O. to JAX	20
TYN to N.O.	50
N.O. to TYN	50

Freightline Costs:

JAX to N.O.	$23,140	
N.O. to JAX	$27,540	
TYN to N.O.	$40,000	
N.O. to TYN	$40,000	
Total	$130,680	per year

Handling and preparation for shipping cost:

JAX to N.O.	$8,000	
N.O. to JAX	$8,000	
TYN to N.O.	$20,000	
N.O. to TYN	$20,000	
Total	$56,000	
Grand Total Shipping Costs	$186,680	per year

SCENARIO 2. MAKE TYNDALL AFB THE CIRF

Number of shipments

JAX to TYN	20
TYN to JAX	20
N.O. to TYN	20
TYN to N.O.	20

F100 ENGINE REPAIR

Freightline Costs:			
JAX to TYN	$15,000		
TYN to JAX	$15,000		
N.O. to TYN	$16,000		
TYN to N.O.	$16,000		
Total	$62,000	per year	
Handling and preparation for shipping cost:			
JAX to TYN	$8,000		
TYN to JAX	$8,000		
N.O. to TYN	$8,000		
TYN to N.O.	$8,000		
Total	$32,000		
Grand Total Shipping Costs		$94,000	per year
Reduced Shipping Costs		**$92,680**	**per year**

Basis for Reconsideration of Realignment of Non-medical Chemical Biological Defense Research from Tyndall AFB, Florida to Aberdeen Proving Ground, Maryland

2005 BRAC Recommendations:

Joint Centers of Excellence for Chemical, Biological, and Medical Research and Development and Acquisition

Recommendation: Realign Tyndall AFB, FL by relocating Non-medical Chemical Biological Defense Research to Edgewood Chemical Biological Center, Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD, and consolidating it with Air Force Research Laboratory.

Economic Impact on Communities: Assuming no economic recovery, this recommendation could result in a maximum potential reduction of 69 jobs (34 direct jobs and 35 indirect jobs) over the 2006-2011 period in the Panama City-Lynn Haven, FL Metropolitan Statistical Area, which is less than 0.1 percent of economic area employment.

Basis for Reconsideration of Realignment of Non-medical Chemical Biological Defense Research from Tyndall AFB, FL to Edgewood Chemical Biological Center, Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD, and consolidating it with Air Force Research Laboratory:

Information gathered from DRAFT DELIBERATIVE DOCUMENT-FOR DISCUSSION PURPOSES ONLY-BRAC FOUO, Attachment 5

Chemical Biological Defense Research Military Value

33 locations were exempted from consideration as a consequence of a TJCSG decision not to analyze locations with less than 31 full time equivalent work years in a function. It was the military judgment of the TJCSG that the benefit to be derived from consideration of those facilities was far outweighed by the cost of the analysis.

Department : Medical JCSG
Scenario File : C:\Documents and Settings\ \Desktop\4 May BRAC\MED0028R rev 5 May (+DTRA MBD) Working Files\FULLY INTEGRATED MED-0028R COBRA_5 May 05 (+DTRA MBD)\MED 28R_Final_INTEGRATED_rev 5May05.CBR
Option Pkg Name: MED 0028R_INTEGRATED ANALYSIS_rev 5May05.CBR
Std Fctrs File : C:\Documents and Settings\ \ Desktop\COBRA 6.10\BRAC2005.SFF

PERSONNEL REALIGNMENTS:
To Base: ABERDEEN, MD (24004)

	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Officers	0	0	12	0	0	0	12
Enlisted	0	0	3	0	0	0	3
Students	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Civilians	0	0	16	0	0	0	16
TOTAL	0	0	31	0	0	0	31

TOTAL PERSONNEL REALIGNMENTS (Out of Tyndall AFB, FL (XLWU)):

	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Officers	0	0	12	0	0	0	12
Enlisted	0	0	3	0	0	0	3
Students	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Civilians	0	0	16	0	0	0	16
TOTAL	0	0	31	0	0	0	31

SCENARIO POSITION CHANGES FOR: Tyndall AFB FL (XLWU)

	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Officers	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Enlisted	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Civilians	0	0	-3	0	0	0	-3
TOTAL	0	0	-3	0	0	0	-3

The Air Force Research Laboratory Materials & Manufacturing Directorate (ML) Airbase Technologies Division (MLQ) at Tyndall AFB, FL has 2 officers, 3 civilians, and 9 contractor personnel (14 FTEs) currently engaged in full-time non-medical chemical biological work.

The number of personnel realigned from Tyndall AFB, FL to Aberdeen, MD listed in the BRAC report as 34 direct jobs and 35 indirect jobs does not match the actual numbers of personnel (14) on Tyndall AFB conducting Non-medical Chemical Biological Defense Research.

Request: ***The BRAC Commission re-solicit and verify the Non-medical Chemical Biological Defense Research personnel numbers submitted by the Air Force for the Non-medical Chemical Biological Defense Research work done at Tyndall AFB, Florida and complete the full analysis of the realignment decision based on the true and accurate numbers.***

Attachment 5

Chemical Biological Defense Research Military Value

ABERDEEN PROVING GROUND MD	**0.5890**
FORT DETRICK MD	**0.4690**
DARPA ARLINGTON VA	0.3252
NAVAL SURFACE WARFARE CENTER DIVISION DAHLGREN VA	**0.2761**
NATIONAL CAPITAL ELEMENT DTRA	**0.1579**
NAVAL MEDICAL RESEARCH CENTER SILVER SPRING MD	**0.1217**
TYNDALL AFB FL	**0.1205**
WALTER REED ARMY MEDICAL CENTER SILVER SPRING MD	**0.0055**

33 locations were exempted from consideration as a consequence of a TJCSG decision not to analyze locations with less than 31 full time equivalent work years in a function. It was the military judgment of the TJCSG that the benefit to be derived from consideration of those facilities was far outweighed by the cost of that analysis.

Chemical Biological Defense Development & Acquisition Military Value

ABERDEEN PROVING GROUND MD	**0.4658**
NAVAL SURFACE WARFARE CENTER DIVISION DAHLGREN VA	**0.4217**
NAVAL SURFFACE WARFARE CENTER DIVISION CRANE IN	**0.1687**
BROOKS CITY-BASE TX	**0.1588**
USA-2_FALLS CHURCH (JPEO CB) VA	**0.0641**

34 locations were exempted from consideration as a consequence of a TJCSG decision not to analyze locations with less than 31 full time equivalent work years in a function. It was the military judgment of the TJCSG that the benefit to be derived from consideration of those facilities was far outweighed by the cost of that analysis.

Capacity at Locations Doing Chemical Biological Defense

Facility Name	Current Capacity SqFt	Current Usage SqFt	Max Potential Capacity SqFt	Capacity Available to Surge SqFt	Required to Surge SqFt	Excess Capacity SqFt
ABERDEEN PROVING GROUND MD	**9,714,389**	**1,142,141**	**9,714,389**	**8,572,249**	**1,256,355**	**8,458,035**
FORT DETRICK MD	**431,550**	**370,948**	**431,550**	**60,602**	**408,042**	**23,508**
NAVAL SURFACE WARFARE CENT DAHLGREN VA	**803,996**	**1,097,841**	**803,996**	**(293,844)**	**1,207,625**	**(403,628)**
NAVAL SURFACE WARFARE CENTER DIV CRANE IN	**1,387,215**	**750,266**	**1,387,215**	**636,949**	**825,293**	**561,922**
BROOKS CITY-BASE TX	**260,624**	**98,730**	**260,624**	**161,894**	**108,603**	**152,021**
NAVAL MEDICAL RESEARCH SILVER_SPRING MD	**15,009**	**89,590**	**15,009**	**(74,581)**	**98,549**	**(83,540)**
USA-2_Falls Church (JPEO CB) VA	**20,938**	**14,880**	**20,938**	**6,058**	**16,368**	**4,570**
WALTER REED ARMY MEDICAL CENTER MD	**147,158**	**19,840**	**147,158**	**147,158**	**21,824**	**125,334**
TYNDALL AFB FL	**251,291**	**42,613**	**251,291**	**208,678**	**46,875**	**204,416**
NATIONAL CAPITAL ELEMENT DTRA	**14,992**	**45,547**	**14,992**	**(30,555)**	**50,101**	**(35,109)**
DARPA ARLINGTON VA	199,335	106,851	199,335	92,484	117,536	81,799