



**DEFENSE BASE CLOSURE AND REALIGNMENT COMMISSION**  
**2521 SOUTH CLARK STREET, SUITE 600**  
**ARLINGTON, VA 22202**  
**TELEPHONE: 703-699-2950**  
**FAX: 703-699-2735**

*June 27, 2005*  
*WWF #4*

Chairman:  
*The Honorable Anthony J. Principi*

Commissioners:  
*The Honorable James H. Bilbray*  
*The Honorable Philip E. Coyle, III*  
*Admiral Harold W. Gehman, Jr., USN (Ret.)*  
*The Honorable James V. Hansen*  
*General James T. Hill, USA (Ret.)*  
*General Lloyd W. Newton, USAF (Ret.)*  
*The Honorable Samuel K. Skinner*  
*Brigadier General Sue Ellen Turner, USAF (Ret.)*

Executive Director:  
*Charles Battaglia*

*Mr. Bob Meyer*  
*Director*  
*BRAC Clearinghouse*  
*1401 Oak St.*  
*Rosslyn, VA 22209*

*Dear Mr. Meyer:*

*I respectfully request a written response from the Department of Defense concerning the following request:*

*Base Closure & Realignment Commission request:*

*There appears to be a reporting discrepancy in the personnel data that Naval Station Ingleside provided during the Department of the Navy's scenario data calls that could significantly alter the economic assessment for closing Naval Station Ingleside. I request the Navy provide a re-certified data call from Naval Station Ingleside and an updated COBRA run for DON-0032 using the corrected data.*

*I would appreciate your response by July 8, 2005. Please provide a control number for this request and do not hesitate to contact me if I can provide further information concerning this request.*

*Yours sincerely,*

*Frank Cirillo*  
*Director*  
*Review & Analysis*



**DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY**  
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY  
1000 NAVY PENTAGON  
WASHINGTON DC 20350-1000

8 July 2005

The Honorable Anthony J. Principi  
Chairman  
Defense Base Closure and Realignment Commission  
2521 South Clark Street, Suite 600  
Arlington, VA 22202

Dear Chairman Principi:

This is a response to the June 27, 2005 (WWF 4) inquiry from Mr. Michael Kessler of your staff concerning the appearance of a discrepancy in the personnel data provided by Naval Station Ingleside.

*There appears to be a reporting discrepancy in the personnel data that Naval Station Ingleside provided during the Department of the Navy's scenario data calls that could significantly alter the economic assessment for closing Naval Station Ingleside. I request the Navy provide a re-certified data call from Naval Station Ingleside and an updated COBRA run for DON-0032 using the corrected data.*

Naval Station Ingleside has now reported additional non-BRAC personnel reductions at Shore Intermediate Maintenance Activity (SIMA) because of the decommissioning of the MHCs. Additionally, during a review of capacity data we discovered an error in the Billets Authorized (BA) reported by the SIMA Ingleside. SIMA Ingleside reported Current Onboard (COB) numbers for personnel vice BA with an excess of 110 personnel, which were subsequently identified for elimination in the COBRA analysis via the scenario data call. A COBRA run was completed using the revised pre-BRAC reductions and the correction in the enlisted BA at SIMA Ingleside. The revised payback results are as follows: The total estimated one-time cost to the Department of Defense to implement this recommendation is \$177.05 million. The net of all costs and savings to the Department during the implementation period is a savings of \$44.33 million. Annual recurring savings to the Department after implementation are \$59.52 million with a payback expected in three years. The net present value of the costs and savings to the Department over 20 years is a savings of \$614.20 million.

Data Call: BRAC Commission 6: Comm req rev Ingleside pers data, 23 June was issued to Naval Station Ingleside and Data Call: BRAC Commission 7: SIMA Ingleside personnel count, 05 July was issued to SIMA Ingleside to obtain data to run a revised COBRA. The data calls and the certified responses are attached. The enclosed disc contains the COBRA run and the associated \*.CBR file.

I trust this information is responsive to your requirements. If we can be of further assistance, or if you would like to meet with me staff to discuss further, please contact us via e-mail to [bracprocess@navy.mil](mailto:bracprocess@navy.mil).

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Anne R. Davis". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large initial "A" and "R".

Anne Rathmell Davis  
Special Assistant to the Secretary of the Navy  
for Base Realignment and Closure

Attachments:  
As stated

Draft Deliberative Document – For Discussion Purposes Only. Do Not Release Under FOIA

**Data Call:** BRAC Commission 7: SIMA Ingleside personnel count, 05 July

**Printed By:** edward.fairbairn **Source:** SIMA\_NRMF\_INGLESIDE\_TX **Date:** 7/7/2005 **Time:** 1639 hrs.

## **Table Of Contents**

### **1. SIMA Ingleside personnel count**

**DoD1000019 Elimination of Personnel - Officers (DoD 21006)**

**DoD1000020 Elimination of Personnel - Enlisted (DoD 21007)**

**DoD1000021 Elimination of Personnel - DoD Civilians (DoD 21008)**

**Section : Elimination of Personnel - Officers (DoD 21006)**

**DoD1000019 For Action #11 of BRAC Scenario DON-0032B, as identified in the SCENARIO DESCRIPTION, provide, by year, the number of OFFICER billets which would be ELIMINATED. Utilize the "Rationale" column to give a brief explanation of your rationale, to include the FY chosen for elimination . Provide a complete answer row for each Action listed in the SCENARIO DESCRIPTION as it applies to your activity. The total of officer eliminations should equal the revised officer BA reported to Naval Station Ingleside for BRAC COMMISSION DATA CALL 6 of 23 June 2005 . Zero officers were transferred in the scenario.**

FY 2006 (Para)	FY 2007 (Para)	FY 2008 (Para)	FY 2009 (Para)	FY 2010 (Para)
0	0	4	0	0
FY 2011 (Para)	Rationale (Text)			
0	Two officer billets eliminated due to MHC decommissioning. No officer billets transferred to gaining command.			

**Section :** Elimination of Personnel - Enlisted (DoD 21007)

**DoD100020** For Action #11 of BRAC Scenario DON-0032B, as identified in the SCENARIO DESCRIPTION, provide, by year, the number of ENLISTED billets which would be ELIMINATED. Utilize the "Rationale" column to give a brief explanation of your rationale, to include the FY chosen for elimination . Provide a complete answer row for each Action listed in the SCENARIO DESCRIPTION as it applies to your activity. The total of Enlisted Eliminations reported here plus the 28 personnel transferred in the scenario should equal the reported BA for 2009 of 209.

FY 2006 (Pos)	FY 2006 (Pos)	FY 2006 (Pos)	FY 2006 (Pos)	FY 2006 (Pos)
0	0	181	0	0
FY 2006 (Pos)	Rationale (Pos)			
0	Reductions due to MHC decommissioning and 28 billets transferring to gaining command.			

**Section :** Elimination of Personnel - DoD Civilians (DoD 21008)

**DoD1000021** For Action #11 of BRAC Scenario DON-0032B, as identified in the SCENARIO DESCRIPTION, provide, by year, the number of DoD Civilian positions which would be ELIMINATED. Utilize the "Rationale" column to give a brief explanation of your rationale, to include the FY chosen for elimination . Provide a complete answer row for each Action listed in the SCENARIO DESCRIPTION as it applies to your activity. The total of civilian eliminations should equal the revised civilian BA reported to Naval Station Ingleside for BRAC COMMISSION DATA CALL 6 of 23 June 2005. Zero civilians were transferred in the scenario.

FY 2006 (Pers)	FY 2007 (Pers)	FY 2008 (Pers)	FY 2009 (Pers)	FY 2010 (Pers)
0	0	1	0	0
FY 2011 (Pers)	Rationale (Text)			
0	Reductions due to MHC decommissioning and 0 FTE transferring to gaining command.			